

**Post-Audit Review 15-02 (#2):
Citywide Employee Training
Program**

November 2016

City Auditor

Stan Sewell, CPA, CGFM, CFE

Senior Auditor

Lisa Culver, CFE





OFFICE OF INTERNAL AUDIT

Stan Sewell, City Auditor

November 10, 2016

To: Mayor Andy Berke
City Council Members

Subject: Post-Audit Review (2nd) of Citywide Employee Training Program (Report #15-02)

Dear Mayor Berke and City Council Members:

At the request of the Audit Committee, we conducted an additional review on the status of audit recommendations in our 2015 Employee Training Program report. The Audit Committee is concerned about the City's ability to ensure and document employees' receipt of policies, as well as ensuring valuable and necessary training is provided to employees.

The purpose of this report is to confirm whether, and to what degree, management has implemented the recommendations made in the original audit issued July 22, 2015.

The original audit concluded:

1. City employees may not always receive the necessary training they need to perform their jobs efficiently and effectively;
2. A Learning Management System (LMS) would centralize employee records, provide training materials and distribute policies as well as enable monitoring of employee's compliance.

The audit had 4 recommendations to improve efficiency and effectiveness of citywide employee training. At the time of our first Post-Audit Review (issued April 5, 2016), two recommendations were not implemented, and two were partially implemented. At the time of this Post-Audit Review, the status of the 4 recommendations remains unchanged from our first Post-Audit Review. We have attached a summary of the status of each recommendation.

At the conclusion of our audit and during our first Post-Audit Review, management's plan to address all of the findings and recommendations hinged on the implementation of an LMS. In our opinion, this is the most effective and efficient methodology to address concerns about training and distribution of policies. City Council approved the purchase of an LMS on March 1, 2016 and a system was purchased on May 4, 2016. However, the system has not been implemented.

This Post-Audit-Review consisted principally of inquiries of City personnel and examinations of various supporting documentation. It was substantially less in scope than an audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. The evidence obtained provided a reasonable basis for our conclusions; however, had an audit been performed, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you and our conclusions may have been modified.

Sincerely,

Stan Sewell, CPA, CGFM, CFE
City Auditor

Attachment

cc: Audit Committee Members
Stacy Richardson, Chief of Staff
Maura Sullivan, Chief Operating Officer
Todd Dockery, Human Resource Administrator

RECOMMENDATIONS NOT IMPLEMENTED (2)

Recommendation	Actions Taken
<p>1 We recommended Human Resources develop a policy which requires all acknowledgment receipts, training certificates, certifications, etc. be maintained in the employee's permanent HR file.</p>	<p><u>As of April 5, 2016:</u> City Council approved the <i>Employee Information Guide</i> which was developed and implemented by the Human Resources Department (HR) as of September 2015. The guide states HR may maintain a file of each employee's records as determined by the HR Director. However, there has been no mandate/policy from the HR Director requiring training certificates and acknowledgement receipts to be maintained in the HR file. Successful completion of the Learning Management System (LMS) will eliminate the need for this recommendation.</p> <p><u>As of November 10, 2016:</u> There has been no mandate/policy from the HR Director requiring training certificates and acknowledgement receipts to be maintained in the HR file. The LMS has not been implemented.</p>
<p>4 We recommended Human Resources, at least on an annual basis, review employee files (preferably via a Learning Management System) to ensure employees are updated on current compliance requirements.</p>	<p><u>As of April 5, 2016:</u> City Council approved, on March 1, 2016, the purchase of a LMS with Cornerstone OnDemand. HR believes the system will be implemented in the next few months. With the purchase of the new LMS, HR will be able to easily document and track employee training and compliance requirements. However, with the current manual file system HR doesn't verify the status of employee's compliance.</p> <p><u>As of November 10, 2016:</u> An LMS was purchased May 4, 2016. With the current manual file system, HR does not verify the status of employee's compliance. The LMS has not been implemented.</p>

RECOMMENDATION PARTIALLY IMPLEMENTED (2)

Recommendation	Actions Taken
<p>2 We recommended HR (or ensure the various departments) provide training and/or written policies and procedures to employees to ensure they are adequately trained and aware of all relevant compliance issues. The training should be documented with the employee's signature and retained in their centralized personnel file.</p>	<p><u>As of April 5, 2016:</u> HR provided training for the new <i>Employee Information Guide</i> distributed this past fall. We selected a sample of employees who attended the training and verified their signed acknowledgement form was present in HR. However, training conducted by the Departments may not always be documented in an employee's permanent file. If used properly, the new LMS should track all employee training and document receipt of policies.</p> <p><u>As of November 10, 2016:</u> Training conducted by the Departments may not always be documented in an employee's permanent file. The new LMS has not been implemented.</p>
<p>3 We recommended HR invest in a citywide Learning Management System. At a minimum, the system should be used to provide training materials, distribute all City policies and compliance materials, and monitor employee's training and policy receipts.</p>	<p><u>As of April 5, 2016:</u> As mentioned above, Council has approved the purchase of a LMS and HR is finalizing contract terms now. According to HR, the system should provide appropriate training needed by employees, house all policies and procedures for each job description, as well as track the completion of training and receipt of policies for all employees.</p> <p><u>As of November 10, 2016:</u> The LMS was purchased on May 4, 2016. The system has not been implemented. Per HR, they have uploaded some policies and are conducting some testing within the HR Department. However, they have been unable to move forward due to issues related to uploading employee data into the new LMS system.</p>

City of Chattanooga Fraud, Waste, and Abuse Hotline

Internal Audit's Fraud, Waste, and Abuse Hotline gives employees and citizens an avenue to report misconduct, waste or misuse of resources in any City facility or department.

Internal Audit contracts with a hotline vendor, The Network, to provide and maintain the reporting system. The third party system allows for anonymous reports. All reports are taken seriously and responded to in a timely manner. Reports to the hotline serve the public interest and assist the Office of Internal Audit in meeting high standards of public accountability.

To make a report, call 1-877-338-4452 or visit our website:

www.chattanooga.gov/internal-audit