



**INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT BOARD  
MONTHLY MEETING MINUTES  
Electronic-Conducted (Virtual) Meeting  
Chattanooga, Tennessee  
for  
April 5, 2021  
11:02 AM**

Present were H.H. (Skip) Ireland, III (Chair), Jimmy F. Rogers, Jr. (Vice-Chair), Ray Adkins, Jelena Butler (Assistant Secretary), and Lance Truett. Absent were James Miller and Althea Jones (Secretary). It was established that a quorum was present virtually in an electronic meeting to conduct business, and the meeting was duly advertised.

Also present were: Phillip A. Noblett (Counsel for the Board); Jason Payne (Public Works Engineering); Charita Allen (ECD); Jermaine Freeman (Mayor's office); Janice Walwyn (Orchard Park Church in Avondale); Eleanor Liu (Finance); Helen Burns Sharp (ATM); and Joseph Paden.

Mr. Ireland called the meeting to order.

**MEETING MINUTES APPROVAL**

On motion of Ms. Butler, seconded by Mr. Truett, the minutes of the March 30, 2021, meeting were unanimously approved as published (5-0) upon roll call vote.

Mr. Noblett congratulated all the new officer holders.

**PERSONS WISHING TO ADDRESS THE BOARD**

Ms. Helen Burns Sharp, Founder of Accountability for Taxpayer Money "ATM", a public interest advocacy group focused on tax incentives and government transparency, was present and had a question about the status of the PILOT reporting. The staff has indicated that this Board and City Council will be getting a report soon on how the companies are doing in meeting their commitments in their PILOT agreements. Typically, these address things like the number of jobs, the amount of investment, and in most cases the average annual wage. The IDB currently has 14 active PILOT agreements. The companies include: Volkswagen (three of Volkswagen suppliers), Amazon, Coca-Cola, HomeServe, the Provident UNUM parking garage, RiverCity Majestic Theatre, Southern Champion Tray, and Van de Weile. Last year, these agreements that are under this Board resulted in over \$21 million in taxes that were not collected by the City and the County. Most of this is Volkswagen. It is important, and the Board wants to know how the companies are doing. Ms. Allen indicated they are all compliant. It would seem like since these are agreements in your name that you would want to be aware of how they are doing and get some progress reports. Ms. Sharp is not sure in the past if this Board has been involved into that loop. The reporting has

been done exclusively with City Council. It is good that staff and this Board say they want to be in the loop and know what is happening.

Ms. Sharp also asked if there was any update on progress on the Tubman public involvement project and what is going to happen with the remainder of the land that does not go to the paint company.

Mr. Ireland stated that Ms. Allen is going to bring us up-to-date on at least what was presented to the City Council. He thinks there are still some additional information that she will supply at future meetings, but what Ms. Sharp is interested in, Ms. Allen has some of that information today. This item will be in Other Business.

Ms. Janice Walwyn is an Elder of the Orchard Park Church in Avondale, as well as the Financial Officer with the Avondale Seventh Day Adventist School in Avondale. Ms. Walwyn had concerns and questions regarding the status of what has already been mentioned by Helen Burns Sharp. Ms. Walwyn wants to know all the information, the status primarily, regarding the public input. Mr. Freeman will cover the public engagement and remaining acreage.

There was no one else present wishing to address the Board.



On motion of Mr. Rodgers, seconded by Mr. Adkins,

A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE CHAIR OR VICE-CHAIR OF THE INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT BOARD OF THE CITY OF CHATTANOOGA TO EXECUTE ANY AND ALL DOCUMENTS RELATED TO A PERMANENT EASEMENT WITH CHATTANOOGA GAS COMPANY, IN SUBSTANTIALLY THE FORM ATTACHED, FOR THE PURPOSE OF CONSTRUCTING AND MAINTAINING A GAS MAIN OR MAINS FOR THE TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF NATURAL GAS, ON PROPERTY LOCATED AT VOLKSWAGEN DRIVE. (VW(CB)67)

Mr. Jason Payne stated this relates to the expansion of Ferdinand Piech Way from the north side of the property to the south end next to the nature park and finishing all the back to Hwy. 58. The gas company had already relocated their line through the section in question between the right-of-way line and the stormwater structures and an easement to go right out of the right-of-way line. Volkswagen has agreed to this already. We are granting them a right-of-way easement for the gas line to be installed. Mr. Noblett stated according to the description, it is a four-foot width area and is trying to get it out of the ditch which is the stormwater control for that area. That is why they are trying to move it over.

After further discussion, the motion carried unanimously with (5-0) upon roll call vote.

On motion of Ms. Butler, seconded by Mr. Adkins,

A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING CHANGE ORDER NO. 9 (FINAL) FOR TALLEY CONSTRUCTION COMPANY RELATIVE TO THE VOLKSWAGEN BSUV-VW STORM WATER IMPROVEMENTS, FOR A TOTAL AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED FIVE HUNDRED FORTY THOUSAND SIX HUNDRED FIFTY-FIVE AND 14/100 DOLLARS (\$540,655.14), AND RELEASING ANY ASSOCIATED FUNDS. (VW(CB)68)

Mr. Payne stated this contract is one that was started when they did the BSUV expansion and upgraded stormwater systems. Over the last few years, they have had several items, but it has been almost a year since they added anything to it. Mr. Payne requested that VW close the contract and get it off the books. The work is done and this is a close-out request and releasing the funds. Ms. Butler had a question of this Change Order No. 9, does that include the previous ones in this packet? We executed Change Order No. 8 in July of 2018. We approved all the other Change Orders. This is only to close out the contract. Everything else has already been processed. Normally, when we do a change order we add to the package the change orders that have been executed.

After further discussion, the motion carried unanimously with (5-0) upon roll call vote.

### VOLKSWAGEN FINANCE REPORT

Ms. Eleanor Liu updated the Board on one single payment in the amount of \$18,813.00. Overall, very few activities. Percent spent, encumbered, and contingencies are at 98.88%. We are within budget.

### PILOT REPORTING PROGRAM

Ms. Charita Allen stated that the City Council sets a policy for Payments in Lieu of Taxes. It is a discretionary incentive that is used by the City and the County. There are certain criteria for projects that are eligible for PILOTs. The program is administered by the Chamber of Commerce and that is through an agreement between the City and the Chamber. We outsource the PILOT piece, the marketing public PILOT program to the Chamber. The chart explains the different roles. It is discretionary, it is a tool that we use. In order for a project to be eligible for a PILOT, it has to be competitive. They have to show that they are able to perform. Typically, PILOTs do not go to start-up companies. It is existing businesses in their industries. The revenues typically have to come from outside the region and that is when we say the company has to have an exportable

product or service because they are bringing new dollars into our economy. The minimum capital investment is typically \$5 million. That is sort of the baseline. The minimum job creation is 50 jobs. Typically, targeted industry sectors are those of the sectors that we are looking to grow here in the economy. Looking at location, some of that is tied to, are we trying to incentivize a company that is coming into a particular part of town. Are they coming into a vacant facility, are they coming into a Brownfield or land that is hard to develop? That is where that location piece comes in. Looking at redevelopment, are they coming into a vacant structure that has not been redeveloped or has been off the tax rolls for some time, how do we get that back on the tax rolls, and the last that they are a good corporate citizen.

PILOT roles, responsibilities, process, looking at policies and procedures, that piece is where the program was audited in 2018 by the City Auditor, and as a result, we came up with formalized policies, procedures, steps, for how we administer PILOTs. The Chamber of Commerce is marketing intake applications. They conduct all of the economic analysis for feasibility. All of that happens behind the scenes. If the project is ineligible, it then comes to City and County staff. We then brief the elected officials, prepare the committee, and agenda items, review the project with both the City and County Mayors and it then goes to City Council for an Economic Development presentation before it goes to full Council for vote and gets on the agenda for Hamilton County Commission agenda session. It is reviewed there with a presentation where it goes to full county for vote. Behind the scenes, once those votes have been completed, the City Attorney's office is preparing the QuitClaim Deed and that is what transfers ownership of the property where the assets to the Industrial Development Board for the term of the PILOT. The next step, the Hamilton County Assessor of Property calculates the in lieu of payments. The Trustee then notifies the projects of the appropriate time of the year, sends in the invoice for their in lieu of payments, and also their economic development fee lease payment. The Trustee then collects those taxes and payments and it then distributes those to the City Treasurer, County Department, and then at some point once that is resolved at the Treasury Level, it then goes to Eleanor Liu who then reconciles all of that with the IDB account. When you get the annual accounting of the different funds of the IDB and show some of the PILOT lease payments, all of that is handled through Eleanor Liu after it comes through the City Treasurer Office.

Annual Monitoring Tasks – these are the new policies that were borne out of the auditing process. Typically, the City staff will meet with the Chamber to review the active PILOTs. That is every November.

Where are we with PILOTs, who do we think is not going to meet their jobs by December 31<sup>st</sup> which is required, going through all of those different pieces. Probably December, commitment letters are mailed to each of the PILOT recipients along with their original agreement and their annual PILOT reporting form. Essentially it says, you are required to report your jobs and your capital investment by the end of the year. Here is your original agreement and we have also attached this form that you need to fill out. You then are also going to have to report your jobs to the Department of Labor, and the jobs also have to be reported to the State Comptroller's Office. Mid-December we call the Chamber, we document sort of this process for updates and a heads up. Do we think everybody is going to be compliant? If someone is not compliant, let us know so that we can make those calls and figure out what is going on.

In January, we meet with the Chamber. All of the companies have to file that report by January 31<sup>st</sup>. They file their report and then in January the City Economic Development staff gets with the Chamber to go through all of those reports that have been filed. The end of January, the PILOT agreements state when the application and their annual reports are due. End of January, Chamber reviews the reports, we discuss the status, and we contact the State to confirm what jobs have been reported quarterly.

In February, the final report comes to both the City and County Economic Departments, and the Mayor. Typically, the last week in January is when the report gets to City and County. But we typically have a heads up as we reported in October of last year. We typically have a heads up so that we know what is going on.

In March, that is when we get together and figure out who is not compliant, what's the penalty going to be, attorneys review the contracts, we contact the company, the company's attorney reviews the contract and agreement. We decide, because each agreement is less than what the penalties are, which of those penalties we are going to exercise.

In April, that is the process we are able now where if anyone is not compliant, that is the process where City staff starts to implement those penalties. In the blue box, it tells you all jobs reported to labor, the Hamilton County website has all of the following information. There is also a PILOT report that is on the State of Tennessee website, and the Assessor of Property website also identifies property operating under PILOT agreements.

#### **IDB Ownership and Real Property Under the Current PILOT:**

At the end of the day, we are probably looking at roughly 27 or so parcels that are currently under IDB ownership:

1. **Amazon** - personal and real property, square footage has been changing. It shows the value and then it shows their contractual commitment, number of jobs, wages, and contractual commitment (the commitment level they have to make in order to remain in the PILOT program or receive incentive). When it says contractual, the agreement has certain levels that they have to meet. They have to report on those levels annually. That is the goal number. This is roughly an \$11 million PILOT, \$135 million in capital investment, and the value says what is reported as the value of the project in the Property Appraiser's Office.
2. **BlueCross/BlueShield** – this was a corporate headquarters retention project. This was a PILOT that pre-dates the Berke Administration but it is still an active PILOT and will be through 2025. Three parcels listed under Property Appraiser's Office. They are under ownership in the IDB during the term of the project. This one has roughly 4,800 employees.

3. **Coca-Cola Bottling Company (Shepherd Road Facility)** – this was another retention project, retaining jobs, creating new jobs. They have met their retention number, they have created additional jobs, they are higher than the wage that they contracted to, and had more capital investment. This is roughly a \$6 million PILOT.
4. **Gestamp** – there are two Gestamp PILOTs. This is going to be the first PILOT for personal property. This one met all of their numbers, exceeded all of their numbers, and is roughly a \$7 million PILOT. Higher job numbers, higher capital investment, higher wages, they were contracted to meet. The second Gestamp one is for the second location. This was again compliant on all levels. Higher capital investment because they did an additional build out. What is important about looking at Gestamp is you have the higher VW company that came in. Typically, if VW receives an incentive, the suppliers do not receive an incentive if VW is their only customer. What happens, the suppliers like a Gestamp, because they have worked with other car manufacturers, they are bringing additional dollars into the economy beyond their work with VW. Some automotive companies receive incentives, PILOTs, and other incentives, they are not just suppliers to VW. When the Chamber is looking at that, they are very clear about – if your only business is related to VW, we incentivized VW to get here, you are not going to get an incentive. But if you are working with other car automotive manufacturers, chances are you are eligible for a PILOT. That is that whole competitive piece.
5. **HomeServe** – met all of their numbers, more than exceeded all of their numbers. They have doubled their contractual job commitment, and they still have additional years to actually meet that qualification to meet those numbers. This was roughly a small PILOT. The value of the PILOT a lot of capital investment and personal property on this one.
6. **M&M Industries** – this is the most recent PILOT. This was completed in 2017. We have not had a new PILOT come into the system since November of 2017. This was a vacant facility on 14<sup>th</sup> Street, had been vacated by another business that went out of business, another manufacturer, went out of business, laid off all of their employees roughly around Christmas time of the year that they closed, and sitting vacant. M&M came in, they had a facility in Lookout Valley, and they were looking to expand in other places, and we wanted them to expand here. In particular, we wanted jobs that are in the core of the City and wanted a company to come into this particular location. Their contractual job commitments, ADA, their goal is 110. They are already at 99 and they have another three years to meet that 110 goal. One of the success stories, they have hired from the neighborhood, they hired previously homeless people. They have been working with the community. This was a great example of the intent of a PILOT coming in with a location specific focus. The PILOT value was just under a million dollars.
7. **Plastic Omnium Interiors** – this originally came in where their focus was looking at automotive manufacturers throughout the southeast, they exceeded their job commitment. They just recently started meeting that job commitment over the last two years. We have seen a lot of wage growth and a lot of job number growth in the last two years.

8. **Southern Champion Tray** – they have three facilities that are operating under the PILOT. They are in the process of building a larger facility to consolidate all of their facility. This was a PILOT in 2015. They met their jobs, they are continuing to expand, they are continuing to grow, they have more than met their capital investment. The real and property assets are under ownership of the IDB.
9. **Volkswagen** – all of the parcels are located at Enterprise South. Job commitment - we are looking at 4,000. It shows them short of their job commitment. Some of them are unfilled jobs due to lack of available workforce. VW on a regular basis has openings. It is just finding enough people to apply for those jobs. They have met all of their other numbers. The actual job piece they are working with Hardware Force Department, American Job Centers, they are working with a number of different organizations locally in the workforce ecosystem to try and fill those jobs.
10. **Yanfeng** – this is an automotive interior manufacturer and work with a number of different automotive suppliers throughout the southeast. Job commitment - they have met their numbers. Capital investment they are shy. Some of that led to the company not building a secondary facility when VW changed its product mix with the different types of vehicles that they were rolling off the lot. That led to this capital investment. Because they did not meet that capital investment, two years ago, City and County elected to penalize on their PILOT payments. They are currently operating under increased payments that were put in place two years ago. If they ever meet that, then their payments would be lowered again, but in the meantime, they will continue to operate under that penalty. That is essentially a one-million-dollar PILOT.

Two PILOTs that were not related to job creation but that are under ownership of the IDB are:

11. **Majestic Cinema downtown**. Its contractual investment commitment was \$7 million. The current value on the facility is \$10.8 million, roughly 50,000 sq. ft., LED certified. That one predates us but is still under ownership of the IDB.
12. **UNUM parking garage** – no reporting requirements on the parking garage, and this one we are looking at the contractual investment commitment was \$21 million. We are showing the actual capital investment was \$19.8 million. There is a deficit there. It was tied to UNUM and UNUM had 2,800 employees. The current value on the parking structure is \$20.9 million. That was a \$5 million PILOT. This is a PILOT that completed in 2020 and rolled off. They met all of their commitments and rolled off of the ownership of the IDB this year. We will start that process to turn that property back over to them and take that property out of IDB ownership. This is a relatively small PILOT.
13. **CBL** - also rolls off this year 2020 and shows their PILOT value for that office building and the current value was roughly \$11 million.

Looking at roughly 28 parcels in excess of a billion dollars in real and personal property under ownership of the IDB. Square footage was right around eight million square feet and some of those numbers are pending. What happens is because this is the first time we have given the IDB this report and because it is a real estate component to it that the City Council does not receive, we are still working with the Property Appraiser's Office, the Trustee's Office to confirm those real property and personal property numbers that are reported on the Property Assessor's website. There is a little clean up on that, there are some properties that were listed as PILOTs for the parking lot but not their buildings. We need to go through and find all of the agreements and double-check.

Mr. Noblett stated that his only question was Alstom. What is the status at this point in time? Ms. Allen stated it has already gone out and we ended it. They had a PILOT that was going to continue to go through 2026. What is the status of that property? Ms. Allen stated that one has been removed from the IDB. That is no longer under sight control. That PILOT ended with the penalties that were put in place for Alstom when they failed to meet the job creation. It is back on the tax rolls.

Mr. Noblett stated that the reason these properties are subject to a Payment in Lieu of Tax amount is that we assume for the IDB the title to this property while that PILOT is in existence. Whenever the PILOT ends at the conclusion of the time period specified in each agreement, then the property reverts back to the owners of the property at that time, and they pay the full taxable rate. The only way they are able to have a reduced tax amount is because the IDB owns the property during that time. Ms. Allen stated that is the additional step when it is over we then have to reverse the process to make sure the property then goes back to the company. We have probably six PILOTs that have rolled off of the books. We have two from 2020 that we need to make sure roll off as well.

Mr. Noblett stated that we will give a QuitClaim then back to the property owners at that time, and they will be responsible for taxes because they are no longer tax exempt. The City Attorney's office handles that.

Mr. Ireland asked if they are paying the education portion of the tax? Ms. Allen said yes. Mr. Ireland wanted to make sure all the members understood that. That is never taken out of the PILOT. Everybody who has the PILOT pays the education portion of the tax. Mr. Noblett stated that every PILOT agreement they do that. There may have been some earlier PILOTs that they may have been before him, but that has always occurred since Mr. Noblett has been involved.

Ms. Allen stated the 2018 policy changes as a result of the City Auditor, we made it very clear as part of that process that the school taxes are always held harmless. They will always pay the school taxes.

Mr. Rodgers asked as far as the average wage, does that account that some of these facilities the potential that there are independent contractors working on-site for the company? Ms. Allen stated it depends on each agreement. There are some agreements that allow for contractors to be included in their job count, and there are other agreements that do not. That is on a case-by-case basis. Typically, we do not include that in the automotive industry. There are certain suppliers



where contractors are a part of how they are structured and how they do business around the southeast and so for them they have negotiated with the State to include contractors as part of their full-time account and there are some that do not. Moving forward, the City Council sets policies. At some point, if the City Council wants to change the policy, that is up to the City Council to change that. Mr. Rodgers asked at this point as far as those figures go, we are subject to whatever reporting system that the employer has in place as far as relative to those independent contractors, if any? Ms. Allen stated yes, but only in the automotive sector with the supplier piece. We are probably not subject to that because that is how they have always done business and that is how they do business across the country so it would be difficult, not impossible, but it would be difficult for us to get them to change that model. It is possible. Mr. Rodgers thanked Ms. Allen for her presentation. Mr. Rodgers requested an e-mail copy of the presentation because it was very helpful.

Ms. Allen stated that what is important about the presentation is it is compiled with data from the Chamber report, Hamilton County, and the State. The key for us, this is the first time we presented this, is figuring out at what point do the reporting numbers come in and how do they all align. For instance, a company that was not compliant in their jobs when they filed their end of year December 31<sup>st</sup>, 2020, report may be compliant now.

As we now start to implement penalties, our first call is to the company and their attorney to say, you're not showing compliant, where are you now. Okay, file those numbers with the Department of Labor, then it goes to the Department of Labor and once those get filed, we then have to call and confirm, and then decide, now do we still want to do a penalty if there are 50 jobs off, do we want to do a penalty. If they are seven jobs off, at what point do we make that call. It is a report but keep in mind it is a report using information from multiple entities and the reporting comes in in different times throughout a six-month period. Ms. Allen says she would not be married to the numbers until we get to a point where, because this is the first time we are doing this for this Board the real estate piece, and it is on a moving target. All the numbers have been reported to the County and State, but there are 2020 numbers that we are just looking at.

**EAST CHATTANOOGA RISING (TUBMAN SITE) TIF**  
**NIPPON PAINT**

Mr. Jermaine Freeman stated that in terms of the question from Ms. Walwyn that she provided about the acreage, that is still owned by the City in our TIF district. It is still the Administration's intent to engage in a community engagement process when it seems that conditions are safe to do so. Obviously, all of that was put on hold because of the pandemic and although there are certainly aspects of our society and community that are re-opening, we are still seeing up-ticking cases. If you read public health reports, we could be on a verge of a fourth surge of COVID-19. That would prohibit us from doing any large in-person gatherings in the form of how we traditionally do community input. It is still the Administration's desire to eventually engage in a community in-put process. We understand that there are probably lots of residents in the area who may not have the ability to access the internet so we are also mindful of that as well. Because we are now at the stage of a transition in administrations, we will pass the baton to the

next Mayoral Administration and the next Office of Economic Development to continue this process forward. At that point, the next administration would then be responsible for conducting the community in-put and then issuing the request for proposals taking that community in-put and using it to inform the way that the RFP is issued to attract the master developer. The plan has not changed, but things have just stalled because of COVID, and until we can figure out a way to embark on and engage in a meaningful community in-put process. Despite the fact that we have a pandemic still around us, as someone described it over the weekend, we may be in the tunnel, and we may be able to see the light at the end of the tunnel in terms of the end of the pandemic, but the light is still a little far away. We are pushing forward and he trusts that the next administration will be able to carry this process forward. Both of our mayoral campaigns that are participating in the runoff election have been briefed about the East Chattanooga Rising TIF Project, so they are both very aware of what is required going forward and what the expectations are for the community.

Ms. Walwyn's question was answered yes and no. She is sure there are some businesses and major stakeholders in the community that could handle a Zoom meeting, and she is one of those. She knows there are several others who are interested. Yes, she understands about the pandemic but she does believe that we could communicate at least the status. Secondly, she does appreciate the fact that we are in a transitional period and understands that and appreciates all that has been done.

Ms. Allen stated that they have been communicating all of their steps to the Avondale Neighborhood Association. When the process started, they presented a signed letter from the members that indicated that all communications should come from the City to them, and they would disseminate it. They have been trying to work with them to get them to distribute the information so that for instance, as we provide them updates, they should be communicating that to the community. They attempted to do some outreach via Zoom and what they discovered was they kept getting the same four or five people on Zoom and did not feel that those four or five people were representative of the entire community. By their fourth or fifth Zoom meeting, they felt like they were doing the community a disservice trying to do it electronically recognizing that they needed to go old school, face-to-face, and to figure that out in the age of COVID and hopefully are crossing that bridge. In the meantime, we are willing to do Zoom, but the issue is they have to have a broader segment of the community that is technology enabled, who has access to Zoom and will participate so that we are not just hearing from the same four or five voices every time.

Mr. Freeman stated that he thinks the other issue that they have also been looking at in terms of the process is just some of the challenges that they may be seeing sort of in the commercial real estate environment. Once we complete the community engagement process, we do want to make sure that we have a strong enough real estate market on the other side of it so that when we issue the RFP for a master developer with the community input that we gather, that there is going to be healthy response to that RFP. It does not do us any good to do a community input and then issue the RFP and not get very good responses back from master developers. That is the other concern that we have is that we are still seeing some softness in certain parts of our economy. Obviously, our economy is trying to roar back to pre-pandemic levels. The most recent jobs report was very encouraging from the U.S. Department of Labor showing that U.S. companies have added over 900,000 jobs. That is all important. But in terms of seeing what we see on the

commercial real estate side, it is going to be important for us to know that once we do the community engagement and issue the RFPs we know that we can get some strong proposals back from master developers because the real estate market is strong. That is going to continue to be something that we will keep an eye on as well as the status of the pandemic and whether or not it is safe to do in-person meetings.

Mr. Noblett stated that we have approved by this body the road development that will be going in which will also speed up because of the deadlines under the agreements that something has to be accomplished by 2022.



### DISCUSSION

Mr. Freeman stated that for the past few years, Ms. Allen and he thoroughly enjoyed the professionalism and the collaboration that has been offered by this Industrial Development Board. To be candid, he is not sure that Ms. Allen and he really knew what an industrial development board did before they started in these roles and so it has been great to work with the Board, great to work with staff, including Phil, Eleanor, Maria, Jason, and Bill Payne. You all have been great to work with and very patient with them and understanding. He and Ms. Allen are both short-timers at this point. They are both serving in appointed positions. They serve at the pleasure of Mayor Andy Berke. Obviously, Mayor Andy Berke's days are numbered as Mayor and so the next Mayor will get to determine who their economic development staff and Mayor's office staff will be.

Next month, for the May meeting, the Board will likely see different faces representing economic development for the City of Chattanooga. But he thinks he speaks for both he and Ms. Allen, when he says it has been an absolute pleasure to work with all. He also wished that Mr. Miller was here as well because we miss him and it was a pleasure getting to know and to work with Mr. James Miller as well as Alan Lebovitz and Althea Jones, but wanted to say thank you for allowing them to go on this journey. Mr. Freeman hopes that they have done the best they could to really help and shape economic development in a way that the Board feels comfortable and that the Board supports.

Ms. Allen stated that she can remember her first board meeting and remember Mr. Adkins asking questions and Mr. Rodgers asking questions and when we ended the meeting, she remembered saying she is going to have to bring her "A" game every single meeting because they are going to ask questions. And what she appreciates about this Board is everyone comes at it from a different angle. We learned we need to be asking businesses about the number of Veterans they have working for them, and what programs they have for Veterans. We need to be asking those hard labor questions, and we need to be asking about the real estate, the values, and the commitments. And we need to be asking about diversity and all of those other pieces. Just presenting to this Board and responding to the questions has put them in a position where it is almost just programmed them to know, we need to be asking the following questions before we even take this to the Board for their vote or approval on an item. Ms. Allen appreciates that because sometimes in economic development, we only look at the jobs and capital investment and miss

some of those other pieces. Typically, in economic development, you are measured based upon number of jobs and number of capital investments and it is more than that. It is the wages and are they contract positions, are they FTE positions, are they W-2s, are they 1099s, it is asking all of those questions.

Ms. Allen has learned a lot, it has been a pleasure, a lot of late nights, when the Board asks for a report. Please know that it is not a one hour of work. It is not like they go away, and we think we can knock that out in an hour. We need to set aside some time because we are going to have to dig into the data and make sure it is right and call groups about uploading. Ms. Allen appreciates the Board being patient as they walk this journey and look forward to all the great things and mega TIFs to be done in the future.

Mr. Ireland will say that on behalf of the Board, we are all volunteers. And even though we each come from a different background, it not only has been a pleasure personally and professionally to work with Ms. Allen and Mr. Freeman, the information that is provided allows them to make what they consider to be good decisions. Some of the information they can neither gather for themselves if they did not roll that up in a format that the Board understands and act on. They do not know how they could move forward as a board.


When Mr. Ireland first came on, he knows Mr. Adkins is the one probably besides himself, who knows the Board was rather simplistic in what they did. He knows Ms. Sharp, a lot goes to hard questions, the Board as a whole, this whole group that is on this call has made this Board much more viable, accountable, and he feels really good about that. He feels real proud about that. A lot of it Charita and Jermaine goes back to you. He is sure they will have some competent replacements, but that will be remise if he did not say we would miss everything Ms. Allen and Mr. Freeman have done and how they have done it. It has been a pleasure to work with them for these last years. Mr. Ireland thanked Ms. Allen and Mr. Freeman.

Mr. Freeman stated that a lot of the furious work that happens in their office is really carried mostly by Ms. Allen who carries the ball like 90 yards down the field, and he comes in and tries to help out for the last ten yards. That is because of the nature of their office his work is divided between Economic Development and the Mayor's Office. All of the reports that the Board sees has really been the work product of Ms. Allen and their newest addition, Kim Narramore. Mr. Freeman wants to say that Ms. Allen has been an absolute gladiator for their office, and pushing things through, and making sure that the projects and reports were in tip top shape before they are presented to the Board.

Mr. Ireland thanked them for all the extras. The Board has been much better. He thinks the questions they ask, just the very format, in which they operate is light years ahead of where they were when he started. Mr. Ireland feels like the Board is much more accountable and have a much better handle on things. Mr. Adkins thinks Phil, Charita, Jermaine, and Maria all keep them in line.

Mr. Ireland adjourned this meeting and hopefully he will run into both Mr. Freeman and Ms. Allen down the road. Best of luck to them. Mr. Ireland asked for the Board to know if the Board will meet in person or not. Mr. Noblett will let the Board know and will let the Board know if he is going to be here in addition to his ten folks that he represents all the time. Mr. Noblett only has to resolve issues with the Mayor and nine Council members. That is what his duties are.

After further discussion, the meeting adjourned at 12:00 p.m.

  
ALTHEA JONES, *Secretary*

APPROVED:

  
H.H. (SKIP) IRELAND, III, *Chair*

*\*The electronic Zoom presentation is kept on record by the Industrial Development Board.*