CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

January 20, 2022

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on January 20, 2022, at 9:31 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Acting Chair Skip Pond called the meeting to order. Secretary Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Steve Lewin explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Skip Pond, Matt McDonald, Clif McCormick, Piper Stromatt, Leanne Kinney, John Brennan

Members Absent: Steve Lewin, Dana Moody

Staff Members Present: Development Review Planner Melissa Mortimer, Secretary Levi Witt, City Attorney Phil Noblett.

Applicants Present: Christian Wilhelm, Lee Metcalf, Kalidas Bhadra, Casey Thornton, Jason Craven, Chris Murphy, Emily Simmering, Mike Orr, Lauren Ledford, Reed Caldwell

Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures.

Approval of Minutes: Matt McDonald made a motion to approve the December 2021 meeting minutes. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, votes taken by roll call, the motion was unanimously approved.

OLD BUSINESS:

Case #HZ-21-163 - 4701 Saint Elmo Avenue - Rear porch

Project Description:

The applicant, Christian Wilhelm, has applied for the following work:

Rear porch addition

Comments from the community:

Applicant Christian Wilhelm spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Piper Stromatt made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-163: 4701 Saint Elmo Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Remove brackets if structurally possible.
- 2. Replace hog wire with like materials for balusters.

Case #HZ-21-167 – 5422 Saint Elmo Avenue – Exterior alterations

Project Description:

The applicant, Lee Metcalf, has applied for the following work:

Renovation, enforcement case

Comments from the community:

Applicant Lee Metcalf spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-167: 5422 Saint Elmo Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Skirt to be stucco.
- 2. Rebuild existing chimney using existing brick and appropriate lime-based mortar.
- 3. Siding to be wood to match exposure and profile of existing.
- 4. Repair all fascia in-kind.
- 5. Maintain and repair any existing historic siding.
- 6. New porch to be concrete and steps.
- 7. Refer to guidelines for front porch spindles and balusters.

NEW BUSINESS:

STAFF REVIEWS:

Melissa Mortimer presented the December staff reviews to the Commission. They were as follows:

- 1. HZ-21-197: 102 Morningside Dr.- in-kind repairs, new roof.
- 2. HZ-21-202: 838 Vine St. Removal of front porch for life/safety. To be rebuilt or new plan submitted.
- 3. HZ-21-212: 930 Oak St. emergency roof repairs
- **4. HZ-21-213**: **109 Eveningside** in-kind repair/replacement of concrete and wood steps
- 5. HZ-21-214: 621 Fortwood Place- roof replacement
- **6. HZ-21-217: 204 Eveningside Dr.-** window replacement of non-original vinyl window for egress
- 7. HZ-21-218: 5525 Alabama Ave. replacement of picket fence with 6' privacy fence in rear.

- 8. HZ-21-220: 4103 Tennessee Ave. roof replacement
- 9. HZ-21-37: 835 Vine Street- Porch roof replacement
- **10. HZ-21-112: 4411 Seneca Ave.** gravel parking pad and privacy fence- vinyl fence denied

Case #HZ-21-180 – 1 Mabel Street – Concrete installations

Project Description:

The applicant, Kalidas Bhadra, has applied for the following work:

• Concrete parking, sidewalks, porch, enforcement case

Comments from the community:

Applicant Kalidas Bhadra spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Matt McDonald made a motion to partially approve Case HZ-21-180: 1 Mabel Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Battery Place Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

The following was approved with conditions:

1. Concrete pad at parking area and area adjacent to garage to be stained a dark brown or darker gray to match the front stairs that are original.

The remainder of the application was deferred to March 17, 2022.

Case #HZ-21-207 - 5504 Alabama Avenue - Garage

Project Description:

The applicant, Casey Thornton, has applied for the following work:

New construction of garage.

Piper Stromatt recused herself from case #HZ-21-207 - 5504 Alabama Avenue.

Comments from the community:

Applicant Casey Thornton spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Leanne Kinney made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-207: 5504 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section

10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. 6 x 6 posts on breezeway.
- 2. Extend upper gable roof from porch to overlap lower gable roof of breezeway.
- 3. Roof to be 6' in width on breezeway.
- 4. Wood panel door to be used as garage door.
- 5. Garage windows to match house.

Case #HZ-21-208 – 5409 Saint Elmo Avenue – Rehab

Project Description:

The applicant, Jason Craven, has applied for the following work:

Rehab

Comments from the community:

Applicant Jason Craven spoke about the work and explained the work in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-208: 5409 Saint Elmo Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. John Brennan seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Retain all historic gable trim and repair.
- 2. Repair existing windows.
- 3. New side porch to match construction (brick and concrete of front porch).
- 4. Existing Victorian entry door to be restored.
- 5. Retain and repair historic frieze trim.
- 6. New doors to match existing Victorian door style (to be submitted to staff for review).
- 7. Gutters to be half-round.
- 8. Maintain and paint existing wood columns.
- 9. Remove existing aluminum siding and restore existing wood siding in-kind.
- 10. Paint all foundations brick (new and existing) in uniform color (existing foundation is painted.

Case #HZ-21-219 - 5525 Alabama Avenue - Solar panels

Project Description:

The applicant, Chris Murphy, has applied for the following work:

Solar panels

Comments from the community:

Applicant Chris Murphy spoke about the project and explained the project to the Commission in further detail. Josh Elkins, a contractor on the project, also spoke. Community member Leslie O'Hare spoke to the Commission in support of the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Matt McDonald made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-219: 5525 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

1. Approval was made based on the proposed project site being a modern-built structure of 2004.

Case #HZ-21-221 - 1613 W, 52nd Street - Rehab

Project Description:

The applicant, Emily Simmering, has applied for the following work:

Rehab

Piper Stromatt recused herself from case #HZ-21-221 - 1613 W. 52nd Street.

Comments from the community:

Applicant Emily Simmering spoke about the project and explained the project to the Commission in further detail. A set of demo plans were entered into the record.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. John Brennan made a motion to defer Case HZ-21-221: 1613 W. 52nd Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, defferal subject to any and all conditions. Skip Pond seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted for the approval.

Case #HZ-21-224 - 932 Fortwood Street - Retaining wall

Project Description:

The applicant, Mike Orr, has applied for the following work:

• Site work: retaining wall, walkways, driveway, steps

Comments from the community:

Designer on the project Caitlin Pilgrim spoke to the Commission and explained the project in further detail. Applicant Mike Orr also spoke about the project. Melissa Mortimer read an email with questions and concerns about the project from community member Nancy Poston.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Skip Pond made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-224: 932 Fortwood Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Leanne Kinney seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

1. All retaining walls, concrete steps, wood steps, stamped concrete, hexagonal pavers, and original driveway, to be repaired in-kind.

Case #HZ-21-225 - 1311 W. 45th Street - New construction

Project Description:

The applicant, Lauren Ledford, has applied for the following work?

New construction of single-family home

Comments from the community:

Applicant Lauren Ledford spoke about the project and explained the project to the Commission in further detail. Community member Laura Lewis spoke about her concerns on the project. Ms. Ledford responded to Ms. Lewis' concerns. Ryan Ledford also spoke about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. John Brennan made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-225: 1311 W. 45th Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

1. Roof ratio to be max of 12:12.

- 2. Driveway to be solid concrete apron, ten feet in length with the remainder to be ribbon style.
- 3. Front window trim to match side and rear windows.
- 4. Setback from street to align with adjacent homes.

Case #HZ-21-228 – 4220 Seneca Avenue – Solar panels

Project Description:

The applicant, Reed Caldwell, has applied for the following work:

Solar panels

Comments from the community:

Applicant Reed Caldwell spoke about the project and explained the project to the Commission in further detail. Josh Elkins, of Carbon Recall, also spoke.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-228: 4220 Seneca Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Leanne Kinney seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted for the approval.

OTHER BUSINESS:

There was no other business.

NEXT MEETING DATE: February 17, 2022 (application deadline: January 21, 2022 at 4 P.M.).

Steve Lewin made a motion to adjourn.

The meeting was adjourned at 1:22 P.M.

Steve Lewin, Chair Date

Levi Witt, Secretary

1-10-12 Date

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

February 17, 2022

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on February 17, 2022, at 9:31 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Clif McCormick made a motion to appoint Dana Moody acting chair of the meeting. John Brennan seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried. Acting Chair Dana Moody called the meeting to order. Secretary Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Dana Moody explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Dana Moody, Matt McDonald, Clif McCormick, Piper Stromatt, Leanne Kinney, John Brennan

Members Absent: Steve Lewin, Skip Pond

Staff Members Present: Development Review Planner Melissa Mortimer, Secretary Levi Witt, City Attorney Phil Noblett.

Applicants Present: Emily Simmering, Christina Williams, Dennis Whipple, Nate Williams, Bea Laurie, Kevin Osteen, Brian Anderson, Aaron Caldwell

Dana Moody explained the rules of procedures.

Approval of Minutes: Matt McDonald made a motion to approve the January 2022 meeting minutes. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

OLD BUSINESS:

Case #HZ-21-221 - 1613 W. 52nd Street - Rehab

Project Description:

The applicant, Emily Simmering, has applied for the following work:

Rehab

Piper Stromatt recused herself from case #HZ-21-221: 1613 W. 52nd Street.

Comments from the community:

Applicant Emily Simmering spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-221: 1613 W. 52nd Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. John Brennan seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Add wood trim piece to match width of corner trim to differentiate new and existing volumes at left some of house.
- 2. Fence to be 4' wood vertical slat privacy fence.

NEW BUSINESS:

STAFF REVIEWS:

Melissa Mortimer presented the January staff reviews to the Commission. They were as follows:

- 1. HZ-21-190: 5505 St. Elmo Ave rear deck enforcement
- 2. HZ-21-194: 1312 W. 45th picket fence
- 3. HZ-21-211: 838 Vine St. demolition of rear porch for life/safety.
- **4. HZ-21-216: 865 Oak Street -** rear porch repair/replace, front steps repaired in-kind.
- **5. HZ-21-230: 4304 Tennessee Ave -** replacement of non-original windows to meet egress.
- **6. HZ-22-3: 830 Vine Street -** slate roof repairs, gutter repairs, install new glass in 2nd floor windows, reinstall attic windows that were restored.
- 7. HZ-22-4: 5205 St. Elmo Ave in-kind replacement of rotten porch flooring
- **8. HZ-22-10: 4915 Virginia Ave -** New windows, no original windows in place, only storms.

- 9. HZ-22-11: 4213 Tennessee Ave aluminum clad basement window
- **10. HZ-22-12: 835 Vine St -** replace rotten fascia and soffits in-kind.
- 11. HZ-22-14: 167 W 53rd St Rear parking pad- enforcement
- 12. HZ-22-22: 5005 Beulah Ave picket fence- enforcement

Case #HZ-21-198 - 5301 Virginia Avenue - Rehab, enforcement

Project Description:

The applicant, Christina Williams, has applied for the following work:

Exterior alterations

Comments from the community:

Applicant Christina Williams spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-198: 5301 Virginia Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Rebuild steps to match existing.
- 2. Window on shed to be submitted for staff review.
- 3. New door and window trim to match existing historic trim.
- 4. New rear door pair to be single-lite or four-lite.
- 5. Drive to be strips.

Case #HZ-21-222 - 4916 Florida Avenue - Fences, enforcement

Project Description:

The applicant, Dennis Whipple, has applied for the following work:

• Front yard hog wire fence, rear horizontal privacy fence

Comments from the community:

Applicant Dennis Whipple spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Matt McDonald made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-222: 4916 Florida Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section

10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. John Brennan seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Front yard wood picket fence to remain.
- 2. Wood on hog wire fence to be stained a darker color.
- 3. Rear wood fence to be vertical boards.

Case #HZ-21-229 – 4721 Virginia Avenue – Outbuilding

Project Description:

The applicant, Nate William, has applied for the following work:

Storage shed

Comments from the community:

Applicant Nate William spoke about the work and explained the work in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Piper Stromatt made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-229: 4721 Virginia Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Color to remain / be in keeping with existing home.
- 2. Block to be in keeping with color of existing concrete.
- 3. Shed to only have windows facing privacy fence or home.
- 4. Shingle to match existing home as close as possible.

Case #HZ-22-1 - 830 Vine Street - Rebuild back porch

Project Description:

The applicant, Bea Laurie, has applied for the following work:

• Rebuild back porch, exterior repairs

Comments from the community:

Applicant Bea Laurie spoke about the project and explained the project to the Commission in further detail.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-1: 830 Vine Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Omit removal of brick.
- 2. Repointing and repair to match construction standards set by existing masonry.
- 3. Composite wood fiber material submitted for staff review.
- 4. Submittal of substrate behind screened door on second floor to staff for approval.

Case #HZ-22-5 – 4301 Saint Elmo Avenue – Outbuilding, rear porch

Case #HZ-22-5: 4301 Saint Elmo Avenue was deferred due to the absence of the applicant. The case will go before the Commission on March 17, 2022.

Case #HZ-22-13 - 4100 Alabama Avenue - Window replacement

Project Description:

The applicant, Kevin Osteen, has applied for the following work:

Replacement of 5 original windows

Comments from the community:

Kevin Osteen spoke to the Commission on behalf of the applicant. Mr. Osteen spoke about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. John Brennan made a motion to deny Case HZ-22-13: 4100 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines, denial subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

Case #HZ-22-15 - 4504 Balcomb Street - Outbuilding

Project Description:

The applicant, Brian Anderson, has applied for the following work:

Storage shed

Comments from the community:

Applicant Brian Anderson spoke about the project and explained the project to the Commission in further detail.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Matt McDonald made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-15: 4504 Balcomb Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. John Brennan seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Color and trim to match existing house.
- 2. Door to be at rear.

Case #HZ-22-17 - 4525 Tennessee Avenue - Addition

Project Description:

The applicant, Aaron Caldwell, has applied for the following work:

Rear addition

Comments from the community:

Applicant Aaron Caldwell spoke about the project and explained the project to the Commission in further detail.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Leanne Kinney made a motion to defer Case HZ-22-17: 4525 Tennessee Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, deferral subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

Case #HZ-22-18 - 4210 Tennessee Avenue - Historic retaining wall

Case #HZ-22-18: 4210 Tennessee Avenue was deferred due to the absence of the applicant. The case will go before the Commission on March 17, 2022.

OTHER BUSINESS:

There was no other business.

NEXT MEETING DATE: March 17, 2022 (application deadline: February 18, 2022 at 4 P.M.).

Leanne Kinney made a motion to adjourn.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:00 P.M.

Steve Lewin, Chair

Levi Witt, Secretary

3-17-22

Date

3-17-2022

Date

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

March 17, 2022

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on March 17, 2022, at 9:33 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Steve Lewin called the meeting to order. Secretary Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Steve Lewin explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Steve Lewin, Matt McDonald, Skip Pond, Clif McCormick, Piper Stromatt, John Brennan

Members Absent: Dana Moody, Leanne Kinney

Staff Members Present: Development Review Planner Melissa Mortimer, Secretary Levi Witt, City Attorney Phil Noblett.

Applicants Present: Kalidas Bhadra, Darryl Smith, Aaron Caldwell, Tom Stebbins, Donna Casteel, Amanda Shaw, Marian Wiggins

Steve Lewin explained the rules of procedures.

Approval of Minutes: Steve Lewin made a motion to approve the February 2022 meeting minutes. Skip Pond seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

OLD BUSINESS:

Case #HZ-21-180 – 1 Mabel Street – Concrete installations

Project Description:

The applicant, Kalidas Bhadra, has applied for the following work:

- Concrete parking, sidewalks, porch.
- This is an enforcement case.

Comments from the community:

Applicant Kalidas Bhadra spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Steve Lewin made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-180: 1 Mabel Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Battery Place Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Skip Pond seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Remove small sidewalk pad near plastic rock cover.
- 2. Backfill upper walkway to top edge of concrete and stain concrete.
- 3. Remove lower sidewalk at street level with CDOT recommendations with every precaution taken to preserve the historic wall.
- 4. Other portions of case have been approved in the January 2022 CHZC meeting.
- 5. Temporary Use permit required to keep upper sidewalks.

Case #HZ-22-5 – 4301 Saint Elmo Avenue – Outbuilding, rear porch

Project Description:

The applicant, Darryl Smith, has applied for the following work:

Construction on outbuilding and rear porch.

Comments from the community:

Applicant Darryl Smith spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-5: 4301 Saint Elmo Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Skip Pond seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Windows and doors to match like pattern of existing.
- 2. Porch beams and columns to be similar to existing.
- 3. Porch floor to be wood tongue and groove.
- 4. Any porch railing to be submitted for staff review.

Case #HZ-22-17 – 4525 Tennessee Avenue – Addition

Project Description:

The applicant, Aaron Caldwell, has applied for the following work:

Rear addition, removal of storage shed.

Comments from the community:

Applicant Aaron Caldwell spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Property owner Thomas Sanders also spoke to the Commission about the project. Melissa Mortimer read emails in support of the project from community members Alex Ingraham, Hannah Forman, and Rachel Holt.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-17: 4525 Tennessee Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

1. Rear pitches to be 10:12 / 4:12 as submitted as additional design option by applicant.

Case #HZ-22-18 – 4210 Tennessee Avenue – Historic retaining wall

Project Description:

The applicant, Tom Stebbins, has applied for the following work:

Rebuild failing historic retaining wall.

Comments from the community:

Applicant Tom Stebbins spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Mr. Stebbins also showed the Commission handouts from Redi-Rock.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Piper Stromatt made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-18: 4210 Tennessee Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Patterns to include cobblestone or limestone with top cap.
- 2. Stairs to be same configuration.
- 3. Final engineered / design to be staff approved prior to construction.
- 4. Two columns to be created / installed at main stairway.

NEW BUSINESS:

STAFF REVIEWS:

Melissa Mortimer presented the February staff reviews to the Commission. They were as follows:

- 1. HZ-21-204: 5110 St. Elmo Ave. Stabilization and repointing of chimney and foundation
- 2. HZ-21-206: 1503 W 48th Exterior alterations, parking pad, fence removal
- 3. HZ-22-2: 4708 St. Elmo Ave. 6' privacy fence
- 4. HZ-22-8: 4211 Michigan Ave. Exterior alterations, deck, fence.
- 5. HZ-22-19: 4614 Tennessee Ave. Roof replacement
- 6. HZ-22-25: 4304 St. Elmo Ave. Reconstruction of back deck
- 7. HZ-22-27: 5401 Ansley Dr. in-kind siding repairs, front porch columns
- 8. HZ-22-28: 838 Vine St. Roof replacement
- 9. HZ-22-31: 1309 W 45th- 4' wood picket fence
- 10. HZ-22-32: 1617 W 53rd- rear deck and stair relocation.
- 11. HZ-22-33: 4401 Tennessee Ave. Exterior alterations, retaining wall, parking pad, fence

- 12. HZ-22-35: 4613 Tennessee Ave. Roof replacement
- 13. HZ-22-36: 5404 St. Elmo Ave. Roof replacement
- 14. HZ-22-37: 4207 Tennessee Ave. Removal of chain-linked fence

Case #HZ-21-231 – 5205 Tennessee Avenue – Demolition

Project Description:

The applicant, Donna Casteel, has applied for the following work:

Demolition of main structure and out building

Comments from the community:

Applicant Donna Casteel spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Tobias Kellogg, owner of the property, also spoke about the project. Cara Kellogg spoke about the project as well. Community member Debbi Sue Psybysz spoke in support of the project. Melissa Mortimer read an email from Kevin Osteen in opposition to the project. Ms. Mortimer also read emails in support of the project from Mr. and Mrs. Edward K. Kellogg, Darrel & Margaret Stewart, Evan Williams, and William and Sarah DeWaters.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Matt McDonald made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-231: 5205 Tennessee Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Skip Pond seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted for the approval.

Case #HZ-22-7 – 841 Fortwood Street – Outbuilding changes from COA

Project Description:

The applicant, Amanda Shaw, has applied for the following work:

Alterations to original COA

Comments from the community:

Applicant Amanda Shaw spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Skip Pond made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-7: 841 Fortwood Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all

conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Brick to be reused on the sides and rear.
- 2. Front corners to have 12" brick return.
- 3. Left side of structure brick may drop lower to allow brick to go to belt line on right side and rear.
- 4. Side door to be half lite.
- 5. Dividers to be removed from rear windows.

Case #HZ-22-41 – 5515 Alabama Avenue – Fence enforcement case

Project Description:

The applicant, Marian Wiggins, has applied for the following work:

Fence

Comments from the community:

Applicant Marian Wiggins spoke about the work and explained the work in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-41: 5515 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Skip Pond seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Add vertical finish boards at exterior of each post.
- 2. Note that horizontal fence was approved as the width of the lot is greater than the depth and, predominately, the fence is located on a flat retaining wall.

OTHER BUSINESS:

There was no other business.

NEXT MEETING DATE: April 21, 2022 (application deadline: March 18, 2022 at 4 P.M.).

Steve Lewin made a motion to adjourn.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:04 P.M.

Steve Lewin, Chair

Levi Witt, Secretary

4-21-2022

Date

4-21-22

Date

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

April 21, 2022

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on April 21, 2022, at 9:34 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Steve Lewin called the meeting to order. Secretary Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Steve Lewin explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Steve Lewin, Matt McDonald, Skip Pond, Dana Moody, Clif McCormick, Piper Stromatt, Leanne Kinney

Members Absent: John Brennan

Staff Members Present: Development Review Planner Melissa Mortimer, Secretary Levi Witt, City Attorney Phil Noblett.

Applicants Present: David Sparks, Debbie Sue Psybysz, Blythe Bailey, Matthew Lewis, Louis Vegard, Jeremy Rardin

Steve Lewin explained the rules of procedures.

Approval of Minutes: Steve Lewin made a motion to approve the March 2022 meeting minutes. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

OLD BUSINESS:

There was no old business.

NEW BUSINESS:

STAFF REVIEWS:

Melissa Mortimer presented the March staff reviews to the Commission. They were as follows:

- 1. HZ-22-44: 4521 St. Elmo Avenue: Porch roof replacement.
- 2. HZ-22-45: 4521 Tennessee Avenue: In-kind replacement of gutters.
- 3. HZ-22-48: 4212 St. Elmo Avenue: Rear deck
- 4. HZ-22-49: 5015 St. Elmo Avenue: Roof replacement

- 5. HZ-22-51: 5205 Alabama Avenue: Rear fence
- 6. HZ-22-52: 4725 Florida Avenue: In-kind replacement of front porch cap and repoint brick
- 7. HZ-22-53: 4402 Tennessee Avenue: Gutters
- 8. HZ-22-56: 838 Vine St. Roof replacement
- 9. HZ-22-31: 1309 W 45th- 4' wood picket fence
- 10. HZ-22-32: 1617 W 53rd- rear deck and stair relocation.
- 11. HZ-22-33: 4401 Tennessee Ave. Exterior alterations, retaining wall, parking pad, fence
- 12. HZ-22-35: 4613 Tennessee Ave. Roof replacement
- 13. HZ-22-36: 5404 St. Elmo Ave. Roof replacement
- 14. HZ-22-37: 4207 Tennessee Ave. Removal of chain-linked fence

Case #HZ-21-146 - 4504 Tennessee Avenue - Outbuilding / storage shed

Project Description:

The applicant, David Sparks, has applied for the following work:

Outbuilding / storage shed

Comments from the community:

Applicant David Sparks spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-21-146: 4504 Tennessee Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Steve Lewin seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Roof pitch to be 4 : 12.
- 2. Foundation to be slab.
- 3. Siding to be either wood or cement siding.
- 4. Board and batten doors to be site-fabricated with horizontal board pattern.

Case #HZ-22-21 – 4917 Virginia Avenue – Rehab

Project Description:

The applicant, Debbie Sue Przybysz, has applied for the following work

Rehabilitation

Comments from the community:

Applicant Debbie Sue Przybysz spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Blythe Bailey also spoke about the project. Senior Zoning Inspector Randy Ridge gave comments on zoning in the City of Chattanooga, and on R-1 zoning, specifically.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Piper Stromatt made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-21: 4917 Virginia Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Front facade option 2 with the following: 6'8" ½ lite door with transom above.
- 2. Double-window on front elevation.
- 3. Poured concrete floor on porches.
- 4. Concrete stairs and pipe rail handrail.
- 5. Trim is 1 x 4, apron 1 x 8, siding 4.5" reveal.
- 6. Windows to remain as proposed on sides / rear.
- 7. Ogee gutters, CMU foundation to be stucco, 6 x 6 porch posts.
- 8. Garage is deferred.

Case #HZ-22-26 - 4923 Virginia Avenue - New construction

Project Description:

The applicant, Debbie Sue Przybysz, has applied for the following work:

New construction

Comments from the community:

Applicant Debbie Sue Przybysz spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Blythe Bailey also spoke about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Leanne Kinney made a motion to partially approve Case HZ-22-21: 4923 Virginia Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval

subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. 6' porch depth.
- 2. 16" roof overhang.
- 3. Stucco foundation.
- 4. Siding is deferred.

Case #HZ-22-34 - 838 Vine Street - Exterior Alterations

Project Description:

The applicant, Karri Luzuriaga, has applied for the following work:

Exterior alterations. Porches.

Comments from the community:

Contractor on the project Matthew Lewis spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Members of the community Katie Schumacher and Kerwin Hetzler spoke in opposition to the project. Matthew Lewis gave a rebuttal to the opposition.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Skip Pond made a motion to partially approve Case HZ-22-34: 838 Vine Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Front porch to be built back to original design with full brick columns and brick handrails with pre-cast caps per historic photo.
- 2. Front porch drainage openings to be max of two bricks in width between between each column.
- 3. Back porch structural elements in current footprint only to be rebuilt for structural support efforts only.
- 4. Back porch design is to be resubmitted for review.

Case #HZ-22-42 – 5406 Virginia Avenue – New construction

Project Description:

The applicant, Kenneth Morris, has applied for the following work:

New construction.

Case #HZ-22-42: 5406 Virginia Avenue was deferred to due the absence of the applicant. The case will go before the Commission on May 19, 2022. Member of the community Louis Vegard expressed his concerns about the project. Melissa read emails from Steven McKinney of 5717 St. Elmo Avenue, Louis Vegard of 5407 Beulah Avenue, and Lynn Newton of 5411 Virginia Avenue in opposition to the project.

Case #HZ-22-46 - 5415 St. Elmo Avenue - Fence & Addition

Project Description:

The applicant, Jeremy Rardin, has applied for the following work:

Backyard picket fence and rear porch addition.

Comments from the community:

Applicant Jeremy Rardin spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Leanne Kinney made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-46: 5415 St. Elmo Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Porch ceiling to be finished with tongue and groove, painted or stained.
- 2. Facia to be added to exposed rater tails with metal rake trim.
- 3. Columns and beams need to be boxed in or stained.

Dana Moody left the meeting.

Case #HZ-22-59 – 4810 Alabama Avenue – Alterations from COA

Project Description:

The applicant, Karri Luzuriaga, has applied for the following work:

Alterations from original COA

Comments from the community:

Contractor on the project Matthew Lewis spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Assistant Director of the Land Development Office Ariel Soriano gave comments to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-59: 4810 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Must install 4 / 1 sash windows as previously approved in window frames already installed.
- 2. Install new door trim to match existing window trim at all exterior new doors.
- 3. Replace wrought iron porch railing to match existing subject to staff approval.
- 4. Install new 15-lite door at front entry to match existing that was removed.
- 5. Deck and fence to be stained.
- 6. Garage to be rebuilt in like kind, subject to all appropriate jurisdictional approvals.

Phil Noblett left the meeting.

OTHER BUSINESS:

CLG National Register Review - Ridgedale Lodge

Matt McDonald made a motion to approve the eligibility of the lodge to be nominated to the CLG National Register Review. Steve Lewin seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

Officer Elections

Steve Lewin nominated Skip Pond and Clif McCormick to serve as the next chair and vice-chair, respectively, of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

NEXT MEETING DATE: April 29, 2022 (Special called meeting. Application deadline: March 18, 2022 at 4 P.M.).

Steve Lewin made a motion to adjourn.

The meeting was adjourned at 1:37 P.M.

Steve Lewin, Chair

Levi Witt, Secretary

10-6-2022

Date

10-6-2022

Date

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

April 29, 2022

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on April 29, 2022, at 9:30 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Steve Lewin called the meeting to order. Secretary Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Steve Lewin explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Steve Lewin, Matt McDonald, Skip Pond, John Brennan, Clif McCormick, Leanne Kinney

Members Absent: Dana Moody, Piper Stromatt

Staff Members Present: Development Review Planner Melissa Mortimer, Secretary Levi Witt, City Attorney Phil Noblett.

Applicants Present: Joseph Gibson, Skip Pond, Peter Ewing, Denise Shaw, Kevin Osteen

Steve Lewin explained the rules of procedures.

OLD BUSINESS:

There was no old business.

NEW BUSINESS:

Case #HZ-22-50 - 5616 Orchid Lane - Storage shed

Project Description:

The applicant, Joseph Gibson, has applied for the following work:

Storage shed

Comments from the community:

Applicant Joseph Gibson spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Steve Lewin made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-50: 5616 Orchid Lane, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Skip Pond seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted for the approval.

Skip Pond recused himself from the following case: case #HZ-22-38: 5606 St. Elmo Avenue.

Case #HZ-22-38 – 5606 St. Elmo Avenue – Rehab

Project Description:

The applicant, Skip Pond, has applied for the following work:

Rehabilitation, new rear addition and deck

Comments from the community:

Applicant Skip Pond spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Leanne Kinney made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-38: 5606 St. Elmo Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, and one abstaining, Skip Pond, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. ¾ lite wood door to be as front door.
- 2. Steel ½ lite rear door.
- 3. Architectural shingles on roof.
- 4. Existing ½ round non-historic porch columns to be removed.
- 5. K-style gutters.
- 6. 2" rear deck balusters.
- 7. Block and brick veneer foundation on addition.

Case #HZ-22-54 - 1714 W. 57th Street - New construction

Project Description:

The applicant, Peter Ewing, has applied for the following work:

New construction

Comments from the community:

Applicant Peter Ewing spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Member of the community Denise Shaw spoke in opposition to the design of the project. Mr. Ewing gave a rebuttal to Ms. Shaw. Assistant Director of the Land Development Office Ariel Soriano gave comments to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Matt McDonald made a motion to deny Case HZ-22-54: 1714 W. 57th Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, denial subject to any and all conditions. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

Case #HZ-22-55 - 5421 Tennessee Avenue - New construction

Project Description:

The applicant, Denise Shaw, has applied for the following work:

New construction of single-family home

Comments from the community:

Contractor on the project Denise Shaw spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-55: 5421 Tennessee Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Skip Pond seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. "Carriage style" wood panel or simulated wood panel garage door with lites.
- 2. Front and side exterior doors to be consistent and ¾ lite.
- 3. Porch railing and balusters optional.
- 4. Masonry chimney is optional.
- 5. Primary fence at north side to not extend forward of midpoint of the house.

Case #HZ-22-57 - 5207 Alabama Avenue - Glass door

Project Description:

The applicant, Alejandro Caraballo, has applied for the following work:

Install modern glass door and opening infill

Case #HZ-22-57: 5207 Alabama Avenue was deferred. The case will go before the Commission on May 19, 2022.

Steve Lewin recused himself from the following case: case #HZ-22-60: 5407 Tennessee Avenue. Skip Pond was appointed acting chair for the duration of the recusal.

Case #HZ-22-60 – 5407 Tennessee Avenue – Fence & Addition

Project Description:

The applicant, Kevin Osteen, has applied for the following work:

Fence, rear addition, deck and driveway

Comments from the community:

Applicant Kevin Osteen spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Member of the community Katie Schumacher spoke in support of the project. Melissa Mortimer read emails in support of the project from David Rice and Meredith McDaniel.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Leanne Kinney made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-60: 5407 Tennessee Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Skip Pond seconded the motion. All in favor, and one abstaining, Steve Lewin, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Windows on back addition subject to staff approval.
- 2. Driveway to be situated along side of house with hammerhead, subject to staff approval of site plan.
- 3. Addition to be recessed by 1' on north and south side with eves.
- 4. Soffit and corner boards to match existing.
- 5. Detailing for side porch to match front porch.
- 6. Submit new drawings and site plans for staff approval.

OTHER BUSINESS:

 Melissa Mortimer thanked Steve Lewin for five years of service to the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission.

NEXT MEETING DATE: May 19, 2022 (Application deadline: April 22, 2022 at 4 P.M.).

Steve Lewin made a motion to adjourn.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:00 P.M.

Steve Lewin, Chair

Lev Witt Secretary

70-6-2022 Date



CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MEETING

DATE: MAY 19, 2022

TIME: 9:30 A.M.

Present: Skip Pond, John Brennan, Dana Moody, Piper Stromatt, Cliff McCormick, Matt McDonald

Absent: Leanne Kinney

Staff: Dottie Cannon and Melissa Mortimer

Staff Attorney: Kathryn McDonald

Minutes: The April minutes were ready to be approved. Cliff McCormick moved to approve the

minutes. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the April minutes were approved.

OLD BUSINESS:

HZ-22-42 – 5406 Virginia Avenue

Melissa presented the case. See Staff Report.

Ken Morris of 5613 Tennessee Avenue addressed the Commission. Mr. Morris said this is a story and a half. It has a tall ridge, and the second story starts at the top plate. It is not a full story. There is no screening plan for the driveway, but he is open to ideas on that. It is a flat lot, less than 3', less than 2' on the front and less than 30" on the back. This will be brick. Ceiling heights are 9'. Porch depth is 6'. The gutters will be typical new construction gutters.

No opposition was present.

Melissa said she received some emails opposing this case. She read the emails.

Ken Morris addressed the Commission in rebuttal. Mr. Morris said the size of the house is a $1 \frac{1}{2}$ story house and is open to doing a 10:12. He said It is conforming with the other homes in the vicinity. There are very few 2 story homes.

Commission Discussion:

Skip asked the members who wanted to make the motion. Dana was concerned with the height of the house. Skip agreed. Cliff said regarding screening of the driveway, the front façade looks like it needs a window. Piper said she thought the pitch was too steep. She said maybe adding windows in the back would help too. She asked how the Commission felt about a vent detail. Skip said he was

good with that. He thought a lap siding would help. The rest of the Commission agreed. Dana said the horizontal siding helps. She still had a problem with the height even bringing to a 10:12. The houses in direct vicinity are one story. John said the applicant changed the pitch, detail and siding and its more than he could imagine. Skip said the way the Commission is feeling is that this house is too big for this lot.

Piper Stromatt made a motion to defer this case as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines. Approval is subject to the following conditions: add decorative vent to main gable, change main gable detail to lap siding or shake and change roof pitch to 10:12 instead of 12:12. Dana Moody seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to defer.

Let the record show that Staff City Attorney Katherine McDonald was present.

HZ-22-57 - 5207 Alabama Avenue

Melissa said the applicant did not post the sign so this case will be deferred.

NEW BUSINESS:

HZ-22-39 - 4614 Glynden Drive

Melissa presented the case. This is new construction for a single-family home. See Staff Report.

Blythe Bailey addressed the Commission. Mr. Bailey said he does some design work on the side and works full time with the City. He is on personal time representing the applicant John Sweet. He said John bought this property several years ago and intends to live in one of these homes. He said it is fairly common to develop a house 2,000 square feet. It is a nice property and they wanted to avoid grading and cutting the property as much as they could. They chose to model the form after a traditional 2 story 4 square house. They chose a hip roof to lower the ceiling height. They are proposing heavy landscaping. The roof pitch is 6:12. He said there needs to be a strong front porch. It is 10' deep. They envision using that front porch a lot. They are putting the garage in the rear. They are showing a standard lap siding 5'-7'. The plan to use concrete block. They want to use a clad window throughout. He said they worked hard to minimize the retaining wall.

No opposition was present.

Commission Discussion:

Skip asked if anyone would like to take this motion. Cliff chose to do so. Skip said the way the roof is shown with a lower pitch helps bring the scale of this one down than the last one even though these are true 2 story houses. Cliff said in this case the porch is going to protrude 6 or 8 feet. Mr. Bailey said he does not want a knee wall because the siding would go to that foundation height. Dana said she thought the house was huge compared to what is on the street. She said by bringing it closer to the road, you are making it even bigger in sight. That is due to part of it being placement and part of

it being the massing of it. Part of that massing is the garage and the guidelines say there should not be a detached garage.

<u>John Sweet, owner of the properties addressed the Commission.</u> Mr. Sweet said he tried to be discreet as possible for having a place to park. He said it is really a one car garage because of the angle. Every foot further back will be a taller wall and more excavation that they are trying to avoid.

Cliff said he does not object for this garage being detached. Blythe said there will be drainage holes in the porch so that water could run off.

Cliff McCormick made a motion to approve Case # HZ-22-39 as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines. Approval is subject to the following conditions: double hung windows front façade, front porch brick knee wall at 32" maximum above porch floor, stucco on foundation to extend back to rear of stair element, house to be moved back on site so that front of porch aligns with a line between front porches of two existing adjacent houses at 4612 and 4618 Glynden Drive and approval of attached, one-car garage not intended to set a precedent for future review of garages and is done so out of full consideration of the project topography and constraints. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. Dana Moody voted no. The motion carried.

Staff Attorney McDonald read from the Code and asked if the Commission had the authority to grant exceptions. Chairman Pond said this Commission makes exceptions at every meeting all the time.

HZ-22-40 – 4616 Glynden Drive

Melissa presented the case. See Staff Report.

<u>Blythe Bailey addressed the Commission.</u> Mr. Bailey said it is similar as to the previous application so he will not repeat everything. He said he would answer questions.

No opposition was present.

Commission Discussion:

Cliff asked if there was a question on the retaining wall. Blythe said they are proposing a retaining wall with some flexibility. They are asking for a stone CMU. Cliff said he would make the motion and discuss the retaining walls. Melissa asked Cliff to specify front retaining wall v. rear retaining wall.

Blythe asked if there could be some flexibility between the massing of the house or the porch.

Cliff McCormick made a motion to approve Case # HZ-22-40 as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines. Approval is subject to the following conditions: front retaining wall to be height to match existing adjacent retaining walls; material to be stone veneer or parge CMU, double hung windows front façade, stucco on foundation to extend back to rear of stair element, house to be moved back on site so that front porch aligns with a line between front porches of two existing adjacent houses at 4612 and 4618 Glynden Drive and approval of attached one-car garage is not

intended to set a precedent for future review of garages and is done so out of full consideration of the topography and constraints. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. Dana voted no. The motion carried.

HZ-22-64 - 4815 Alabama Avenue

Melissa presented the case. See Staff Report.

John Allen Brooks of 4815 Alabama Avenue addressed the Commission. Mr. Brooks wanted to apologize because he did not think he needed a COA. He thought he got the stop work order for the mulch he spread out. Melissa said no it was for the work he continued to do even though he was told not to. He argued that point. He said he looked up and down Alabama and saw three difference kinds of retaining walls. He said it is not over 4' tall and it fits the context of his house. At the corner he has rocks and a guardrail. He said the gentleman who had done this for him in the past put together this for him and he was supposed to clean the area. Mr. Brooks said he relied upon his contractor who told him that it should not be over 4' tall. He said was going to put a wrought iron fence around. He said all he can do is ask for forgiveness. It has stopped him for 2 months. He said St. Elmo is unique and he has pics of all different kinds of retaining walls. This will be unique made up of stone and concrete. He said he thinks this is an overreach and he thinks he meets the standards of the St. Elmo Code.

No opposition was present.

Commission Discussion:

Skip asked if there was natural stone there and Mr. Brooks said yes. He said concrete is covering the stone wall. He built that house before his wife passed away and he is just trying to finish the project, as this was her last wish. Dana said the guidelines for new construction is not very detailed. But the guidelines guide us for keeping in the historical character. There are a lot of walls on this street, but they all fit into that historical nature of the neighborhood. John said the walls should be made of the same materials. Mr. Brooks said he built those stairs. He said the stairs and walls were all torn down during the construction. Skip said we need to ask if this wall is appropriate to stay.

Dana Moody made a motion to deny Case # HZ-22-64 as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines. John Brennan seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was denied.

At this point Mr. Brooks said that the structure would be staying for a long time.

HZ-22-67 - 4510 Alabama Avenue

Melissa presented the case. See Staff Report

<u>Sam Lubin of 4510 Alabama Avenue addressed the Commission.</u> Mr. Lubin said they have been in this home for 30 years and they anticipate staying. They are sensitive to maintaining the historic integrity of the neighborhood. He said they tried to find something close to a nice fence as possible.

They wanted to have a fence to last a long time and a wood fence would not last long. The only reason they needed a commission review on the deck is that they would not have the 2" balustrades in the back.

No opposition was present.

Commission Discussion:

Matt said he has the motion on this one. He thinks it will be an attractive plan. The black fence will at least mimic the historic look. He does not have a problem with the balustrades. Dana said there are multiple porches that have been added to the houses. She said the proposal is consistent with nearby houses.

Matt McDonald made a motion to approve Case # HZ-22-67 as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines. Cliff seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

HZ-22-73 - 1309 W. 45th Street

Melissa presented the case. See Staff Report. The backyard is not visible to the street.

Robert Gettys of 1309 W. 45th Street addressed the Commission. Mr. Gettys said they wanted a deck. They will not have a sidewalk, or the screen as depicted in the picture. The designer put that in. They will have that workshop. He said you cannot see the workshop from the street.

No opposition was present.

Commission Discussion:

Dana said she drove by and can attest that no one can see it from the street. Ms. Stromatt concurred. Melissa said to note that the concrete sidewalk and screen will not be on there. Cliff said he noticed a flat roof. All decks are stained in this district. He can do a light stain. He said the deck will be stained or sealed. Cliff said the window on south elevation to be approved.

John Brennan made a motion on Case # HZ-22-73 as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines. Approval is subject to the following conditions: concrete sidewalks are deleted from the design, privacy screen at rear of shed is deleted from the design, deck to be stained or sealed and window on south elevation is approved. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

HZ-22-80 - 5424 Alabama Street

Melissa presented the case. This is new construction. See Staff Report

<u>Keith McCallie of 8545 Guild Trail addressed the Commission.</u> Ms. McCallie said this is a custom home for a couple from Atlanta. They will be residents of Chattanooga as of June 1st. Their kids and grandkids are here. They have selected a design that really fits in the neighborhood. It is a

combination of 1 and 2 story classic. The footprint is 3 bedrooms 2 ½ bathroom with a mud room. The detached garage is smaller in scale than the house. The front of the house faces Alabama Avenue. The only access to the street is through the front yard. They are asking approval of 15′ setback from the property line and that puts them pretty much in line with the other houses. Their columns will be closer to 8″ at the top of the base of about 12. The columns will be painted. They have selected a traditional horizontal window. On the back of the house there is an awning window. They changed the double hung window size. This window is only visible from the back yard and will not match the other windows of the house. On the second floor they put the windows in the front, and they are about 4 inches bigger. They are requesting encasement windows on the second floor. The foundation height should be less than 3′-6″ but they are not finalizing it entirely. The windows are aluminum clad. They would like to reduce the garage and set it further back on the lot about 10′. The neighboring house is 50′ off the street. The garage setback will be closer to 40′.

No opposition was present.

Commission Discussion:

John said what we are seeing and what is being described is not what we are seeing here today. Skip asked if this meeting could be deferred to next month. Melissa said she does not have time to do that. Ms. McCallie said the windows shown are the ones she is submitting but she has a few little changes. The garage doors have not changed. The windows at the top have not changed but request to be encasement. The windows at the bottom will be changed will not change the overall style of the house. Dana said she is concerned about the garage in particular. Part of it is the size of the garage and part of it is opening it up to the road and being such a dominant part of the façade of the house. The concrete is a concern. She is also wondering if using the traditional material would solve that. Dana said she wanted to make sure if there is a garage there that it is appropriate.

Cliff McCormick made a motion to defer Case # HZ-22-80 as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines. John Brennan seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

Other Business:

None

With no further business, the meeting adjourned.

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION MINUTES

May 26, 2022

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on May 26, 2022, at 9:33 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Clif McCormick called the meeting to order. Secretary Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Clif McCormick explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: John Brennan, Dana Moody, Clif McCormick, Piper Stromatt, Leanne Kinney

Members Absent: Matt McDonald, Skip Pond

Staff Members Present: Development Review Planner Melissa Mortimer, Secretary Levi Witt, City Attorney Emily O'Donnell

Applicants Present: Nic Hughes, Donna Casteel, Michael Kenner, Mika Clark

Clif McCormick explained the rules of procedures.

OLD BUSINESS:

There was no old business.

NEW BUSINESS:

Case #HZ-22-71 - 1189 W. 46th Street - New construction

Project Description:

The applicant, Nic Hughes, has applied for the following work:

New construction of single-family home with driveway

Comments from the community:

Applicant Nic Hughes spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Member of the community Tom Bates expressed his concerns about the project to the Commission. Melissa Mortimer read an email with questions and concerns about the project from Vickie Bates. Nic Hughes responded to the concerns from the community.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Leanne Kinney made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-71: 1189 W. 46th Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Dana Moody seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. 10" box columns on front porch.
- 2. Porch baluster material to be wood.
- 3. Metal roof specs to adhere to guidelines.
- 4. Driveway to be concrete.
- 5. Front door to be wood.
- 6. Roof pitches not to exceed 12:12.
- 7. Lap siding reveal to be 5 to 6 inches.
- 8. Baluster to be wood and adhere to guidelines.
- 9. 2" x 2" square.
- 10. Foundation of house to be set as low as possible on uphill side.
- 11. Front first floor window to be single-hung 6 / 6 to match dormer window.
- 12. Stucco material on foundation.

Case #HZ-22-77 – 4506 Balcomb Street – Demolition

Project Description:

The applicant, Donna Casteel, has applied for the following work:

Demolition

Comments from the community:

Applicant Donna Casteel spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Code inspector for the City of Chattanooga Randy McBee also spoke about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. John Brennan made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-77: 4506 Balcomb Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. Three in favor, and two opposed, Dana Moody and Leanne Kinney, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted for the approval.

Case #HZ-22-79 – 114 Eveningside Drive – Rear addition

Project Description:

The applicant, Michael Kenner, has applied for the following work:

Rear addition

Comments from the community:

Applicant Michael Kenner spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. John Brennan made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-79: 114 Eveningside Drive, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Ferger Place Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Dana Moody seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Rear addition to be defined by delineation with a vertical 2" trim board.
- 2. Roof covering to be architectural shingles.

Case #HZ-22-82 - 1201 W. 46th Street - New construction

Project Description:

The applicant, Nic Hughes, has applied for the following work:

New construction of single-family home and driveway

Comments from the community:

Applicant Nic Hughes spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Melissa Mortimer read an email with concerns about the project from Tom and Vickie Bates.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Piper Stromatt made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-82: 1201 W. 46th Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. John Brennan seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Roof pitches to be 12:12.
- 2. Balusters 2 x 2 wood.
- 3. Siding to be 5" to 6" lap siding.
- 4. Foundation to be dropped to finished floor.
- 5. Metal roof to be standing seam.
- 6. 6 / 1 SDL aluminum clad windows.
- 7. Single-hung windows with coordinating lites.
- 8. 1/4 lite door with no grids.
- 9. Porch columns 8" or 10" box columns.
- 10. Driveway to the left of home.

Case #HZ-22-83 – 5000 Florida Avenue – COA Alterations

Project Description:

The applicant, Mika Clark, has applied for the following work:

Alterations from COA HZ-21-148.

Comments from the community:

Applicant Mika Clark spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Code Enforcement officer for the City of Chattanooga Joshua Chandler expressed his concerns about the project. Mika Clark responded to the concerns.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to defer Case HZ-22-83: 5000 Florida Avenue, as

submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, deferral subject to any and all conditions. Leanne Kinney seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted for the approval.

<u>Case #HZ-22-85 – 1709 W. 43rd Street – Demolition</u>

Project Description:

The applicant, Joshua Chandler, has applied for the following work:

Demolition

Comments from the community:

Applicant Joshua Chandler spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to deny Case HZ-22-85: 1709 W. 43rd Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, denial subject to any and all conditions. Leanne Kinney seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the denial:

- 1. Noted that the "for sale" price listed in newspaper is far above market price and does not list a "good faith" effort to sell the property.
- 2. No risk to public safety appears to require the demolition of the structure.
- 3. No owner has been produced.

OTHER BUSINESS:

There was no other business.

NEXT MEETING DATE: June 16, 2022 (Application deadline: May 20, 2022 at 4 P.M.).

Dana Moody made a motion to adjourn. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:17 A.M.

Clif McCormick, Chair

Levi Witt, Secretary

10 -6 - 2022 Date

10 -6 - 2022

Date

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

June 16, 2022

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on June 16, 2022, at 9:32 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Skip Pond called the meeting to order. Secretary Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Matt McDonald, Skip Pond, John Brennan, Dana Moody, Clif McCormick, Piper Stromatt, Leanne Kinney, Nathan Bird

Members Absent:

Staff Members Present: Development Review Planner Melissa Mortimer, Secretary Levi Witt, City Attorney Phil Noblett

Applicants Present: Keith McCallie, Ed Wiseman, Brian Murray, Alejandro Caraballo, Sean Compton

Clif McCormick explained the rules of procedures.

OLD BUSINESS:

Case #HZ-22-80 - 5424 Alabama Avenue - New construction

Project Description:

The applicant, Keith McCallie, has applied for the following work:

New construction of single-family home and garage

Comments from the community:

Applicant Keith McCallie spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. John Brennan made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-80: 5424 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section

10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Dana Moody seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Windows to be aluminum clad in material.
- 2. Foundation material to be poured concrete or parged concrete block.
- 3. Foundation height to meet guidelines at the front of the home.

NEW BUSINESS:

May Staff Reviews

Melissa Mortimer presented the staff reviews for May to the Commission:

- 1. HZ-22-61: 4512 Balcomb St.- Rear deck extension, replacement of porch columns.
- 2. HZ-22-78: 1607 W 43rd St. In-kind replacement of handicap ramp
- 3. HZ-22-88:114 Eveningside Dr. Removal of vinyl siding and in-kind repairs of asbestos siding
- 4. HZ-22-90: 4417 Seneca Ave Replacement of non-original front door
- 5. HZ-22-91: 1720 W 57th St. Roof replacement, in-kind roof repairs, door replacement.
- 6. HZ-22-92: 825 Vine Street- Roof replacement
- 7. HZ-22-93: 5003 St. Elmo Ave. 6' privacy fence
- 8. HZ-22-94: 5311 St. Elmo Ave. Retaining wall repairs
- 9. HZ-22-96: 5409 St. Elmo Ave. COA renewal
- 10. HZ-22-97: 5212 Sunnyside Ave.- Exterior alterations and site work
- 11. HZ-22-99: 955 Vine St.- Porch roof replacement in-kind
- 12. HZ-22-102: 950 Vine St.- Rebuild original limestone wall that has collapsed. Removal of gravel
- 13. HZ-22-104: 621 Fortwood Place- In-kind replacement of rotten wood, broken glass and cloth awning.
- 14. HZ-22-105: 4114 St. Elmo Ave.- Roof replacement

Case #HZ-22-95 - 876 Oak Street - Rear addition alterations

Project Description:

The applicant, Ed Wiseman, has applied for the following work:

Alteration to rear addition

Comments from the community:

Applicant Ed Wiseman spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. A drawing from Mr. Wiseman was entered into the record for spacing purposes.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Dana Moody made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-95: 876 Oak Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Siding to be hardie board.
- 2. Deck not to interfere with oriel window.
- 3. Paint color is suggested to be consistent with rest of house.
- 4. Windows on back elevation may be originally-proposed 8 windows or may be reduced to 4 windows as proposed in meeting (drawing submitted to file).
- 5. Stairs and trim stained to match house.

Case #HZ-22-100 – 5212 Sunnyside Avenue – Exterior alterations

Project Description:

The applicant, Brian Murray, has applied for the following work:

Enforcement, exterior alterations

Comments from the community:

Applicant Brian Murray spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Leanne Kinney made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-100: 5212 Sunnyside Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. This case is a unique situation, and should not set a precedent.
- 2. Windows to be vinyl clad, TDL or SDL and submitted to staff for approval.
- 3. Exterior lighting to be period appropriate and staff approved.
- 4. Original front porch rail to be preserved and reused subject to code.

OLD BUSINESS:

Case #HZ-22-57 – 5207 Alabama Avenue – Garage alterations

Project Description:

The applicant, Alejandro Caraballo, has applied for the following work:

• Install modern glass door and opening infill

Comments from the community:

Applicant Alejandro Caraballo spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Matt McDonald made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-57: 5207 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. John Brennan seconded the motion. Seven in favor, and one opposed (Dana Moody), the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Awning to be 2' or less off the structure.
- 2. Awning to be painted or stained to match existing colors.
- 3. Pine wood is allowed.

NEW BUSINESS:

Case #HZ-22-101 – 4300 Tennessee Avenue – Alterations to COA

Project Description:

The applicant, Sean Compton, has applied for the following work:

Alterations to COA

Comments from the community:

Applicant Sean Compton spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Cliff McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-101: 4300 Tennessee Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. Seven in favor, and one opposed (Dana Moody), the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

1. Vinyl windows on rear addition to be replaced with windows to meet guidelines. Size may vary.

OTHER BUSINESS:

There was no other business.

NEXT MEETING DATE: July 21, 2022 (Application deadline: June 17, 2022 at 4 P.M.).

Skip Pond made a motion to adjourn. Dana Moody seconded the motion.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:54 A.M.

Skip Rond, Chair

Levi Witt, Secretary

7/21/2022 Date 7/11/2022

Date

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

July 21, 2022

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on July 21, 2022, at 9:33 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Skip Pond called the meeting to order. Secretary Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Matt McDonald, Skip Pond, John Brennan, Dana Moody, Clif McCormick, Piper Stromatt, Nathan Bird

Members Absent: Leanne Kinney

Staff Members Present: Development Review Planner Sarah Robbins, Secretary Levi Witt, Staff Attorney Melinda J. Foster

Applicants Present: Aaron Caldwell, Marti Hatcher, Nathan Shirai, Jerri Price, Amanda Cox

Approval of Minutes: Matt McDonald made a motion to approve the June 2022 meeting minutes. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures.

OLD BUSINESS:

There was no old business.

NEW BUSINESS:

June Staff Reviews

Sarah Robbins presented the staff reviews for June to the Commission:

- 1. HZ-22-98: 5003 St. Elmo Avenue fence
- 2. HZ-22-106: 823 Oak Street- COA renewal
- 3. HZ-22-108: 931 McCallie Avenue- Enforcement. Walkway and stairs
- 4. HZ-22-109: 4714 St. Elmo Avenue Front porch restoration

- 5. HZ-22-110: 5409 t. Elmo Avenue Retaining wall
- 6. HZ-22-111: 5112 Tennessee Avenue new roof shingles
- 7. HZ-22-112: 4707 Alabama Avenue Fence
- 8. HZ-22-114: 4111 Tennessee Avenue rear deck
- 9. HZ-22-120: 4908 Florida Avenue remove chain link and install wood privacy

Case #HZ-22-86 – 4706 Alabama Avenue – Rear addition

Project Description:

The applicant, Aaron Caldwell, has applied for the following work:

Rear addition

Comments from the community:

Applicant Aaron Caldwell spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Jason Hamill, owner of the property, also spoke to the Commission about the project. A photo of the house, "Exhibit A" was entered into the record. Mr. Hamill read an email from David McAllister in support of the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. John Brennan made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-86: 4706 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. New basement sliding door width to be consistent width of the existing opening and door is to be submitted for staff approval.
- 2. Balusters at new deck and stairs to be 2" x 2" square and installation and final design to be submitted for staff approval.
- 3. New windows to be installed at basement are to be 3: 1 light pattern, to match existing windows, and are to have external grids.

Case #HZ-22-89 - 1611 W. 51st Street - Carport

Project Description:

The applicant, Marti Hatcher, has applied for the following work:

Carport

Comments from the community:

Applicant Marti Hatcher spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Katie Gas, Ms. Hatcher's daughter, also spoke to the Commission about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Dana Moody made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-89: 1611 W. 51st Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Match the eave profile of the house (i.e. no diamond motif or brackets).
- 2. Color and siding to match character of house.
- 3. New drawing submitted for staff approval.

Case #HZ-22-116 - 1504 W. 51st Street - Prefab shed / outbuilding

Project Description:

The applicant, Nathan Shirai, has applied for the following work:

Prefab shed / outbuilding

Comments from the community:

Applicant Nathan Shirai spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Piper Stromatt made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-116: 1504 W. 51st Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Existing shed to be removed from property.
- 2. To be painted to match house.
- 3. No windows in shed.
- 4. Door to be non-decorative door.

Case #HZ-22-118 - 5001 Beulah Avenue - Rear addition and pool

Project Description:

The applicant, Jerri Price, has applied for the following work:

Rear addition and pool

Comments from the community:

Applicant Jerri Price. spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Applicant Jerri Price requested to defer the project. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

Case #HZ-22-119 – 4520 Tennessee Avenue – Exterior alterations

Project Description:

The applicant, Amanda Cox, has applied for the following work:

Exterior alterations

Comments from the community:

Amanda and Aden Cox spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Piper Stromatt made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-119: 4520 Tennessee Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Dana Moody seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

Clif McCormick exited the meeting.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Exterior doors to be staff approved.
- 2. Exterior side porch door to remain.
- 3. Side porch to remain and be repaired in-kind.
- 4. Staff approval for lattice work on front facade.
- 5. Front porch rails to be repaired / replaced in-kind.
- 6. Brick shall not be painted.

OTHER BUSINESS:

There was no other business.

NEXT MEETING DATE: August 18, 2022 (Application deadline: July 21, 2022 at 4 P.M.).

Dana Moody made a motion to adjourn. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:06 P.M.

Skip Pond Chair

Levi Witt Secretary

9/15/2022 Date

Date

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

August 18, 2022

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on August 18, 2022, at 9:30 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Skip Pond called the meeting to order. Secretary Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Matt McDonald, Skip Pond, John Brennan, Dana Moody, Clif McCormick, Piper Stromatt, Leanne Kinney, Nathan Bird

Members Absent:

Staff Members Present: Development Review Planner Melissa Mortimer, Secretary Levi Witt, Staff Attorney Kathryn C. McDonald

Applicants Present: Chris Dufresne, Leanne Kinney, Jennifer Zellner, Patrick Ryan, Lee Brock.

Approval of Minutes: Matt McDonald made a motion to approve the July 2022 meeting minutes. John Brennan seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures.

OLD BUSINESS:

There was no old business.

NEW BUSINESS:

July Staff Reviews

Melissa Mortimer presented the staff reviews for July to the Commission:

- 1. HZ-22-70: 4314 St. Elmo Avenue fence
- 2. HZ-22-113: 840 Fort Wood Street Site alterations
- 3. HZ-22-121: 1616 W. 52nd Street Roof replacement

- 4. HZ-22-125: 5509 St. Elmo Avenue replacement of damaged porch materials with tongue and groove.
- 5. HZ-22-126: 4316 St. Elmo Avenue roof replacement
- 6. HZ-22-127: 951 Vine Street Removal of large oak tree in ROW per City Forester
- 7. HZ-22-128: 5301 St. Elmo Avenue in-kind replacement of concrete sidewalk and front stairs.
- 8. HZ-22-129: 4102 St. Elmo Avenue 3' wood picket fence on front and side of property
- 9. HZ-22-131: 4709 Florida Avenue replacement or non-original rear door.
- 10. HZ-22-132: 205 Morningside Drive roof replacement
- 11. HZ-22-133: 5513 St. Elmo Avenue rear privacy fence
- 12. HZ-22-137: 4300 Tennessee Avenue front yard fence, enforcement.

Case #HZ-22-117 - 4277 Westridge Road - New construction

Project Description:

The applicant, Chris Dufresne, has applied for the following work:

New construction of single-family residence and gravel drive

Applicant Chris Dufresne was not present at the meeting and requested a deferral for case #HZ-22-117: 4277 Westridge Road. The case was deferred and will go before the Commission on September 15, 2022.

Leanne Kinney recused herself from the following case: case #HZ-22-123: 5000 Florida Avenue. Ms. Kinney is the applicant.

Case #HZ-22-123 - 5000 Florida Avenue - Alterations to original COA

Project Description:

The applicant, Leanne Kinney, has applied for the following work:

Alterations from COA HZ-21-148 - new ownership

Comments from the community:

Applicant Leanne Kinney spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. The Commission requested input from City Attorney Phil Noblett on the case.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Piper Stromatt made a motion to defer Case HZ-22-123: 5000 Florida Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section

10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. John Brennan seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the deferral:

- 1. Letter from [City Attorney] Phil [Noblett] stating no conflict of interest of purchase of home from Commission member.
- 2. Boundary line survey to be conducted to either allow the proposed stoop with steps or porch.
- 3. Plans to be revised with new proposal if there is a front porch.
- 4. Vestibule to be built back per original COA.

Case #HZ-22-134 - 5419 Saint Elmo Avenue - Enforcement, exterior alterations, rear addition

Project Description:

The applicant, Jennifer Zellner, has applied for the following work:

• Enforcement. Window replacement - new ownership. Proposed rear dutch gable addition, fence, new windows, new siding and window casing / trim.

Comments from the community:

Applicant Jennifer Zellner spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Matt McDonald made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-134: 5419 Saint Elmo Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. Seven in favor and one opposed, Dana Moody, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Replacement windows to be wood or vinyl clad.
- 2. Maintain any original windows with staff approval of any replacement windows.
- 3. Fence along the adjoining property line to be 6' in height.
- 4. Fence along right-of-ways to be 4' in height.
- 5. Fence to be single-row flat board construction.
- 6. Fences returning to house should be same height as the next adjacent sequent.

A majority of original windows and trim were removed by the previous owner without COA approval.

Case #HZ-22-135 - 915 Vine Street - Outbuilding

Project Description:

The applicant, Patrick Ryan, has applied for the following work:

Replacing rear outbuilding / shed

Comments from the community:

Applicant Patrick Ryan spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Dana Moody made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-135: 915 Vine Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted for the approval.

Case #HZ-22-136 – 203 Eveningside Drive – Exterior alterations

Project Description:

The applicant, Lee Brock, has applied for the following work:

 Exterior alterations, including new french door opening, expanding window openings, moving windows, adding shake in dormers, new shutters and new rear porch railings and porch columns, and a new chimney cap.

Comments from the community:

Lee Brock spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. John Brennan made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-136: 203 Eveningside Drive, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Ferger Place Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Front elevation dormer to be painted or stained shake siding.
- 2. The material, reveal and size to be staff approved.
- 3. Vinyl shutters are to be removed and not reinstalled.
- 4. Rear porch wood columns to be a minimum of 6 x 6.

OTHER BUSINESS:

Melissa Mortimer announced the appointment of Todd Morgan, Executive Director of Preserve Chattanooga, to the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission. Mr. Morgan was appointed to the Commission on August 9, 2022 and will begin on September 15, 2022.

NEXT MEETING DATE: September 15, 2022 (Application deadline: August 19, 2022 at 4 P.M.).

Skip Pond made a motion to adjourn.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:13 A.M.

Skip Pond, Chair

evi Witt, Secretary

9/15/2012 Date 9-15-2012

Date

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

September 15, 2022

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on September 15, 2022, at 9:30 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Skip Pond called the meeting to order. Secretary Tara Little called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Matt McDonald, Skip Pond, John Brennan, Dana Moody, Clif McCormick, Piper Stromatt, Leanne Kinney, Nathan Bird, Todd Morgan

Members Absent:

Staff Members Present: Development Review Planner Melissa Mortimer, Secretary Tara Little, Deputy City Attorney Phillip A. Noblett

Applicants Present: Chris Dufresne, Jerri Price, Leanne Kinney, Tristan Ramsey, Jared Heuter, Emily Eck, Brad Jacobs

Approval of Minutes: Clif McCormick made a motion to approve the August 2022 meeting minutes. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures.

OLD BUSINESS:

Cliff McCormick recused himself from the following case: <u>#HZ-22-117: 4277</u> Westridge Road.

<u>Case #HZ-22-117 - 4277 Westridge Road - New construction of single-family</u> home

Project Description:

The applicant, Chris Dufresne, has applied for the following work:

New construction of single-family residence and gravel drive

Comments from the community:

Katie Taylor spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Designer on the project Heidi Hefferlin also spoke about the project. Member of the community Don Halworth spoke to the Commission and asked questions about ingress and egress. Melissa Mortimer read an email with concerns about the project from Erynn Wheatley Cash and an email in support of the project from Mike and Grace Viertel.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Dana Moody made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-117: 4277 Westridge Road, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Leann Kinney seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted for the approval.

Case #HZ-22-118 – 5001 Beulah Avenue – Rear addition and pool

Project Description:

The applicant, Jerri Price, has applied for the following work:

Rear addition and pool

Comments from the community:

Applicant Jerri Price spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-118: 5001 Beulah Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted for the approval.

Leanne Kinney recused herself from the following case, #HZ-22-123: 5000 Florida Avenue, as she is the applicant on the case.

Case #HZ-22-123 - 5000 Florida Avenue - Alterations to original COA

Project Description:

The applicant, Leanne Kinney, has applied for the following work:

• Alterations from COA HZ-21-148 - New ownership, gravel driveway

Comments from the community:

Applicant Leanne Kinney spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Piper Stromatt made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-123: 5000 Florida Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

1. Front vestibule or covered front porch option to be submitted for staff approval.

NEW BUSINESS:

August Staff Reviews

Melissa Mortimer presented the staff reviews for August to the Commission:

- 1. HZ-22-140: 5404 Ansley Dr. Gutters, roof replacement, chimney rebuild.
- 2. HZ-22-139: 5503 Alabama Ave. Small retaining wall and 3' picket fence.
- **3. HZ-22-142: 5518 Alabama Ave.** Replacement of front steps with new concrete, replacement of metal columns with 8x8 wood columns, new period appropriate front door.
- 4. HZ-22-148: 4703 Florida Ave. Metal handrail on front steps for safety.
- 5. HZ-22-149: 1606 W 51st St.: in-kind siding repairs
- **6.** HZ-22-150: 5401 Ansley Dr.: 3' picket fence
- 7. HZ-22-152: 4120 St. Elmo Ave. In-kind fence and deck replacement, small rear patio.
- 8. HZ-22-146: 841 Oak Street- lap pool
- 9. HZ-22-147: 5407 Virginia Ave- enforcement, new deck on rear

Case #HZ-22-141 – 4500 Alabama Avenue – Alterations from COA

Project Description:

The applicant, Tristan Ramsey, has applied for the following work:

Alterations to COA HZ-21-155

Comments from the community:

Brandon Taylor spoke to the Commission and answered questions about the project. Melissa Mortimer read an email from Ellen Tucker with concerns about the project. Mr. Taylor responded to Ms. Tucker's concerns.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Nathan Brid made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-141: 4500 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. Three in favor and four opposed, the motion failed. Leanne Kinney made a motion to defer Case HZ-22-141: 4500 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, deferral subject to any and all conditions. Nathan Bird seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

There were conditions noted for the deferral:

1. Applicant to provide information about condition of underlying asbestos siding. If not salvageable, provide options in addition to vinyl to re-side house.

Case #HZ-22-145 – 4914 Florida Avenue – Rear addition and secondary structure

Project Description:

The applicant, Jared Heuter, has applied for the following work:

New construction of accessory building and rear addition

Comments from the community:

Applicant Jared Heuter spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. The Commission requested input from City Attorney Phil Noblett on the case. Melissa Mortimer read emails with concerns about the project from Brad and Wendy Allison. Mr. Heuter responded to Mr. and Mrs. Allison's concerns.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. John Brennan made a motion to defer Case HZ-22-145: 4914 Florida Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, deferral subject to any and all conditions. Nathan Bird seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted for the deferral.

Case #HZ-22-143 - 503 Battery Place - New construction

Project Description:

The applicant, Emily Eck, has applied for the following work:

New construction

Comments from the community:

Brad Jacobs spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Matt McDonald made a motion to defer Case HZ-22-143: 503 Battery Place, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Battery Place Design Guidelines, deferral subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted for the deferral.

OTHER BUSINESS:

There was no other business.

NEXT MEETING DATE: October 20, 2022 (Application deadline: September 16, 2022 at 4 P.M.).

Skip Pond made a motion to adjourn.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:13 A.M.

Skip Pond, Chair

Leyi Witt, Secretary

2/8/2023

2.8-2023

Date

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

October 20, 2022

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on October 20, 2022, at 9:35 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Skip Pond called the meeting to order. Secretary Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Matt McDonald, Skip Pond, Clif McCormick, Piper Stromatt, Leanne Kinney

Members Absent: John Brennan, Dana Moody, Nathan Bird, Todd Morgan

Staff Members Present: Administrative Support Assistant Levi Witt, Assistant Director of Development Services Ariel Soriano, Staff Attorney Melinda J. Foster

Applicants Present: Tristan Ramsey, Jared Heuter, Michael McGowan, Frank Green, Darryl Smith, Alison Van Winkle

Approval of Minutes: Clif McCormick made a motion to approve the September 2022 meeting minutes. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures.

OLD BUSINESS:

Case #HZ-22-141 - 4500 Alabama Avenue - Alterations from COA

Project Description:

The applicant, Tristan Ramsey, has applied for the following work:

Alterations from COA HZ-21-155

Comments from the community:

Applicant Tristan Ramsey spoke about the alterations and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Levi Witt read emails with concerns and requests for clarification about the project from Ellen Tucker and Kevin Osteen.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Piper Stromatt made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-141: 4500 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Leann Kinney seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Asbestos to be repaired or replaced with Hardie material or like kind.
- 2. Windows to be confirmed with staff on material / replacement.

Case #HZ-22-145 – 4914 Florida Avenue – Rear addition and secondary structure

Project Description:

The applicant, Jared Heuter, has applied for the following work:

New construction of accessory building and rear addition

Comments from the community:

Applicant Jared Heuter spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Levi Witt read emails with concerns about the project from Brad and Wendy Allison. Jared Heuter responded to the concerns.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Leanne Kinney made a motion to partially approve Case HZ-22-145: 4914 Florida Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Reuse original historic windows within original home or addition.
- 2. Original materials of back exterior wall to remain with the house.
- 3. Minimum column size of 6 x 6 on rear porch; beam detailing to match existing front porch.
- 4. Flare on original foundation to turn vertical on addition for differentiation from original house.
- 5. ADU design to be deferred to confirm sq. ft. requirements.

Case #HZ-22-143 – 503 Battery Place – New construction

Project Description:

The applicant, Michael McGowan, has applied for the following work:

New construction

Comments from the community:

Michael McGowan spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Brad Jacobs also spoke about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Matt McDonald made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-143: 503 Battery Place, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Battery Place Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Concrete pool decking and walls to have a finished color that matches the brick mortar of main structure.
- 2. Landscape and accent lighting to come back to staff for approval.
- 3. Driveway to be a finished color to match mortar.
- 4. The accepted plans / renderings is the darker brick option.

NEW BUSINESS:

September Staff Reviews

Levi Witt presented the staff reviews for September to the Commission:

- 1. HZ-22-76: 4903 Tennessee Ave. Rear deck, in-kind porch replacements
- 2. HZ-22-153: 1412 W 53rd St. Retaining wall and fence
- 3. HZ-22-154:5685 Lee Ave. Alterations from original COA.
- 4. HZ-22-155: 5600 Alabama Ave. Roof replacement
- 5. HZ-22-156: 102 Morningside COA renewal
- 6. HZ-22-157: 4522 Alabama Ave. Stairs added to rear deck
- 7. HZ-22-158: 5402 Alabama Ave. Retaining wall
- 8. HZ-22-159: 4013 St. Elmo Ave. Gutters
- 9. HZ-22-162: 4711 Alabama Ave. removal and reinstallment of siding.
- 10. HZ-22-138: 4016 St. Elmo Ave. Window restoration and replacement of non-original windows

<u>Case #HZ-22-151 – 4714 Florida Avenue – Rear addition, demo of outbuilding and parking pad</u>

Project Description:

The applicant, Frank Green, has applied for the following work:

• Rear addition, parking pad, demo of storage building.

Comments from the community:

Applicant Frank Greene spoke to the Commission and answered questions about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-151: 4714 Florida Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Leanne Kinney seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

There were no conditions noted for the deferral.

Case #HZ-22-161 - 5608 Alabama Avenue - Rear addition and rehabilitation

Project Description:

The applicant, Darryl Smith, has applied for the following work:

Rear addition, parking pad, demo of storage building

Comments from the community:

Applicant Darryl Smith spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-161: 5608 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the deferral:

- 1. Vertical 4" trim where new and existing siding meet.
- 2. New 3'-0" x 6'-8" front door to be submitted for staff approval.
- 3. Gable vent to be maintained over front porch.
- 4. Area below new deck to be screened with horizontal wood slats to be submitted for staff approval.
- 5. Existing aluminum siding to remain except new siding may be installed in lieu of existing aluminum at rear and left hand side back to wall separating original house and porch.
- 6. Columns to be 4 x 4 nominal with minimum 1x wood trim wrap. This may result in a finished size less than 6 x 6.

Case #HZ-22-163 - 4907 Guild Trail - Storage shed

Project Description:

The applicant, Alison Van Winkle, has applied for the following work:

New storage shed, removal of current shed

Comments from the community:

Alison Van Winkle spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Leanne Kinney made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-163: 4907 Guild Trail, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all

conditions. Clif McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted for the approval.

OTHER BUSINESS:

There was no other business.

NEXT MEETING DATE: November 17, 2022 (Application deadline: October 21, 2022 at 4 P.M.).

Matt McDonald made a motion to adjourn. Leanne Kinney seconded the motion.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:33 P.M.

Skip Pond, Chair

Levi Witt, Secretary

12/15/2022 Date

Date

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

November 17, 2022

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on November 17, 2022, at 9:30 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Skip Pond called the meeting to order. Secretary Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Matt McDonald, Skip Pond, John Brennan, Dana Moody, Clif McCormick, Leanne Kinney, Nathan Bird, Todd Morgan

Members Absent: Piper Stromatt

Staff Members Present: Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer, Administrative Support Assistant Levi Witt, Staff Attorney Melinda J. Foster

Applicants Present: Kerri Moore, Robert Swafford, Scott White, Francesco Pizzuto, Devin Wilkinson, Owen Macllelan,

Approval of Minutes: Clif McCormick made a motion to approve the September 2022 meeting minutes. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures.

OLD BUSINESS:

There was no old business.

NEW BUSINESS:

October Staff Reviews

Melissa Mortimer presented the staff reviews for October to the Commission:

- 1. HZ-22-144: 1410 W 54th St.: Extension of 6' fence in backyard
- 2. HZ-22-166: 4116 St. Elmo Ave.: COA renewal
- 3. HZ-22-168: 1227 W 53rd St.: Steps on rear porch

- 4. HZ-22-170: 4907 Guild Trail: Replacement of front door
- 5. HZ-22-171: 1709 W 56th St.: Roof replacement
- 6. HZ-22-173: 4013 St. Elmo Ave.: In-kind replacement of damaged porch floor.
- 7. HZ-22-167: 1613 W 53rd St. New door installed in original enclosed door opening and retaining wall
- 8. HZ-22-175: 216 Lindsay St.: damaged tree removal
- 9. HZ-22-176: 4402 Tennessee Ave. Restoration of original wood windows in-kind
- 10. HZ-22-177: 4413 Tennessee Ave. Removal of chain link fence and installation of 3' picket fence
- 11.HZ-22-180: 4617 Tennessee Ave. Rear deck

Case #HZ-22-130 - 4022 Saint Elmo Avenue - Deck / porch

Project Description:

The applicant, Daniel Moore, has applied for the following work:

Enforcement, rear deck

Comments from the community:

Kerri Moore spoke about the alterations and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Melissa Mortimer read an email from Daniel Moore, the applicant, explaining the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-130: 4022 Saint Elmo Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Dana Moody seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Balusters to be 2" x 2" minimum and vertical orientation.
- 2. Existing balusters to be replaced.

Case #HZ-22-160 – 4515 Saint Elmo Avenue – Removal of rear windows

Project Description:

The applicant, Robert Swafford, has applied for the following work:

Remove two rear windows

Comments from the community:

Applicant Robert Swafford spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. John Brennan made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-160: 4515 Saint Elmo Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Nathan Bird seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted for the approval.

Case #HZ-22-164 - 5404 Ansley Drive - Demolition of rear addition

Project Description:

The applicant, Scott White, has applied for the following work:

Demolition of rear addition

Comments from the community:

Scott White spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Dana Moody made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-164: 5404 Ansley Drive, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Todd Morgan seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

1. Steps and stoop to meet St. Elmo design guidelines and to be staff approved.

Case #HZ-22-178 - 1709 W. 56th Street - Skylights

Project Description:

The applicant, Francesco Pizzuto, has applied for the following work:

Installation of skylights

Comments from the community:

Applicant Francesco Pizzuto spoke to the Commission and answered questions about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Leanne Kinney made a motion to deny Case HZ-22-178: 1709 W. 56th Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, denial subject to any and all conditions. Dana Moody seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

There were no conditions noted for the denial.

Case #HZ-22-179 – 5202 Tennessee Avenue – New construction

Project Description:

The applicant, Devin Wilkinson, has applied for the following work:

New construction, driveway, garage in basement

Comments from the community:

Applicant Devin Wilkinson spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission. Member of the community Tobias Kellog spoke to the Commission. Melissa Mortimer read an email in opposition to the project from Lynne Woodside.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. John Brennan made a motion to deny Case HZ-22-179: 5205 Tennessee Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, denial subject to any and all conditions. Clif McCormack seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted for the denial.

Case #HZ-22-182 – 5419 Saint Elmo Avenue – Siding and rear steps

Project Description:

The applicant, Jennifer Zellner, has applied for the following work:

Replace all siding

Comments from the community:

Owen MacIlelan, a contractor on the project, spoke to the Commission about the project. Barbara Zellner also spoke about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Matt McDonald made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-182: 5419 Saint Elmo Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Leanne Kinney seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Siding in gables to be consistent with the rest of the house.
- 2. Size of trim and size of windows to remain as originally designated in keeping with historic facades.
- 3. Current siding may be removed or be covered, so long as the reveals and trim remain in character of similar historic homes.

OTHER BUSINESS:

There was no other business.

NEXT MEETING DATE: December 15, 2022 (Application deadline: November 18, 2022 at 4 P.M.).

Todd Morgan made a motion to adjourn. Dana Moody seconded the motion.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:03 A.M.

Skip Pond, Chair

Levi Witt, Secretary

Date

Date

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

December 15, 2022

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on December 15, 2022, at 9:35 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Skip Pond called the meeting to order. Secretary Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Matt McDonald, Skip Pond, Dana Moody, Clif McCormick, Piper Stromatt, Leanne Kinney, Nathan Bird, Todd Morgan

Members Absent: John Brennan

Staff Members Present: Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer, Administrative Support Assistant Levi Witt, Staff Attorney Melinda J. Foster

Applicants Present: Jason Craven, Nate Hefner, Keith McCallie

Approval of Minutes: Matt McDonald made a motion to approve the October 2022 meeting minutes. Todd Morgan seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures.

OLD BUSINESS:

There was no old business.

NEW BUSINESS:

November Staff Reviews

Melissa Mortimer presented the staff reviews for November to the Commission:

- 1. **HZ-22-183: 4609 Alabama Ave:** Removal of non-original siding to expose original, in-kind repairs brick repairs.
- 2. HZ-22-184: 940 Fort Wood St: Roof replacement
- 3. HZ-22-186: 4513 Tennessee Ave: Roof replacement

- 4. HZ-22-188: 5685 Lee Ave: 3' tall picket fence
- 5. HZ-22-189: 4908 Florida Ave: Retaining wall and patio
- 6. HZ-22-194: 1605 W 54th St: Roof replacement
- 7. HZ-22-195: 5010 Tennessee Ave: door replacement

Case #HZ-22-165 – 5010 Tennessee Avenue – Garage

Project Description:

The applicant, Jason Craven, has applied for the following work:

• Enclose carport to make garage

Nathan Bird recused himself from this case: case# HZ-22-165: 5010 Tennessee Avenue.

Comments from the community:

Jason Craven spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Leanne Kinney made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-165: 5010 Tennessee Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Gable and siding to be painted.
- 2. Base structure post and brackets to be enclosed.
- 3. Beam on sides to be painted to match siding.

Case #HZ-22-187 – 4614 Saint Elmo Avenue – Retaining wall

Project Description:

The applicant, Nate Hefner, has applied for the following work:

Rear retaining wall for parking pad

Comments from the community:

Applicant Nate Hefner spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Todd Morgan made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-187: 4614 Saint Elmo Avenue, as

submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Railings to meet St. Elmo Design Guidelines per staff approval.
- 2. Concrete to be stained neutral / earth-tone color.
- 3. Redi-rock is an option for wall construction.

Case #HZ-22-191 - 4567 Alabama Avenue - Addition / alteration

Project Description:

The applicant, Keith McCallie, has applied for the following work:

Addition and garage alterations

Comments from the community:

Keith McCallie spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Clif McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-191: 4567 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Nathan Bird seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

- 1. Double French door in lieu of siding door on front porch (door may be outswing).
- 2. All new trim to match existing.

OTHER BUSINESS:

There was no other business.

NEXT MEETING DATE: January 19, 2022 (Application deadline: December 16, 2022 at 4 P.M.).

Skip Pond made a motion to adjourn.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:36 A.M.

Skip Pond, Chair

Levi Witt, Secretary

Date 1/19/2023

Date