

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

April 20, 2023

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on April 20, 2023, at 9:33 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chairman Skip Pond called the meeting to order. Secretary Dottie Cannon called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Chairman Pond explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting was being recorded.

Members Present: Matt McDonald, Skip Pond, John Brennan, Dana Moody, Clif McCormick, Nathan Bird, Todd Morgan, Piper Stromatt and Leanne Kinney

Members Absent: None

Staff Members Present: Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer, Administrative Support Assistant Dottie Cannon, Deputy Director of Land Development Office, Ariel Soriano and Staff Attorney Andrew Trundle

Applicants Present: Lance Truett, Brian Owens, Matthew Lewis, Nathan Hertzog, Jennifer Zellner, Owen Maclellan, Paul and Liz Winters

Approval of Minutes: Todd Morgan made a motion to approve the March 2023 meeting minutes. Dana Moody seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve the minutes as written.

Chairman Skip Pond explained the Rules of Procedures.

OLD BUSINESS:

HZ-22-193: 5003 St. Elmo Avenue - Rear Addition

Let the record show that Nathan Bird recused himself from this case.

Project Description:

The applicant, Lance Truett, has applied for the following work:

- **Rear garage addition**

Lance Truett addressed the Commission. Mr. Truett spoke about the sliding glass doors. He said the space will be used as a primary living space. He felt that the sliding glass doors would bring in more natural light and make direct access to the outside.

Comments from the community: None

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Todd Morgan made a motion to approve Case HZ-22-193: 5003 St. Elmo Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Cliff McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

1. New windows match existing structure, including using French doors instead of sliding,
2. Exterior finishes also match the existing structure.

HZ-23-24: 1715 W. 57th Street - Rear Addition

Melissa Mortimer presented the case in her Powerpoint presentation.

Project Description:

The applicant, Brian Owens, has applied for the following work:

- **Rear addition**

Brian Owens of 1253 Market Street addressed the Commission. Mr. Owens said they are bumping out the shed roof 5 ½" to delineate. They are trying to get an appropriate size living room. They intend to keep the doors and windows and trim intact. He said there is a lot of precedent in the neighborhood.

Comments from the community: None

Let the record show that Nathan Bird is back in the meeting after recusing himself from the previous case.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Piper Stromatt made a motion to approve Case HZ-23-24: 1715 W. 57th Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Nathan Bird seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

1. Add initial trim detail on sides of home for delineation of addition,
2. Balusters/posts to be in keeping with current style on home,
3. Keep back wall door and window openings in current locations.

NEW BUSINESS:

• **March Staff Reviews**

1. HZ-23-25: 112 Morningside Drive - Roof replacement
2. HZ-23-29: 4711 Alabama Avenue - Wood windows and doors added to non-historic accessory building
3. HZ-23-31: 1503 W. 48th Street - Replacement of non-historic retaining wall
4. HZ-23-32: 1618 W. 53rd. Street - Privacy fence in rear picket in front
5. HZ-23-34: 5402 Alabama Avenue - Picket fence
6. HZ-23-35: 5525 St. Elmo Avenue - Awning
7. HZ-23-37: 1607 W. 43rd Street - Repoint stone masonry with in-kind lime mortar
8. HZ-23-40: 4707 Alabama Avenue - In-kind flat roof replacement
9. HZ-23-42: 835 Vine Street, Unit A - Tree removal

**Melissa Mortimer presented the staff reviews for March to the Commission:
Commission Cases to Review:**

1. HZ-23-27: 4609 Alabama Avenue - Rehab
2. HZ-23-28: 5108 Beulah Avenue - Porch Alterations
3. HZ-23-36: 5419 St. Elmo Avenue - Alterations from COA
4. HZ-23-38: 4703 Florida Avenue - Storage Shed

Case #HZ-23-27 – 4609 Alabama Avenue – Rehab

Project Description:

The following case is an enforcement case for the following work:

- **Rehab**

Melissa Mortimer presented the case in her Powerpoint presentation.

Attorney Harry Cash addressed the Commission. Mr. Cash said he was an attorney with the law firm of Grant, Konvalinka & Harrison. He is here with Mr. Matthew Lewis today and Mr. Lewis can answer the technical questions about the construction. He said Mr. Lewis could not save the original wood siding because it was rotting. So he removed the old wood siding and used Hardi Board, which is acceptable under the Guidelines. He read from the St. Elmo Guidelines.

Matthew Lewis addressed the Commission. Mr. Lewis said the original ribbon driveway could not be replaced, as it had an 8' hole or well right in the middle that was caused by water damage and topography of the property. He thought the best thing to do was to slope the driveway so as not to cause further damage to the house. He graveled the entire driveway with pea gravel, which is acceptable in the Guidelines. He said he did not want to do the driveway in a cheap way so that is why he spent more money on pea gravel. The windows were changed some time after the house was built and he went with the 2 and not the 3 windows. The windows on the north side were restored to their original position. He said originally the sidewalk was not brick. He said someone had been a brick mason and replaced some of the brick. The original mortar does not have to be used and it was not used because of the mismatched brick. The original roof of the garage was changed. He said it was close to the ground as it is so he does not see how the garage could be diminished in height.

Comments from the community: Emailed letters

Melissa Mortimer said there were a number of submitted letters in support of the case. These were emailed to the Commission prior to review. They were from: Jonathan Bussey, Brian Saffold, Angela & Virgil Fox, Gary Whitehead-Nudd, Jennifer Thaggard, The Polloms, Tyler & Yesenia, Mark van der Waarde & Evelyn Greter, Mike Viertel and Esme Wright Oehmig.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Questions and answers were directed at Mr. Lewis and Mr. Cash. Mr. Lewis said he was sorry for not going through the process of coming before the Commission. He said he is an expert in the field of restoring historic houses. He said this is the first time he restored using Hardi Board. He said he tried to use the original siding but it was so bad he had to put sheathing on the membrane. The Commission members told Mr. Lewis that they preferred to see some drawings. Also, Chairman Pond told Mr. Lewis that there are guidelines to follow and Mr. Lewis knows better. After discussion, it was decided to defer this case to the next meeting.

Cliff McCormick made a motion to defer Case HZ-23-27 to the May meeting: 4609 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines,

approval subject to any and all conditions. Nathan Bird seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to defer to next month.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

1. Submittal of complete application in accordance with Guidelines found in City Code, specifically including plan elevations, material lists, and photographic evidence of historical condition.

Case #HZ-23-28 – 5108 Beulah Avenue – Porch Alterations

Project Description:

The applicant, Nathan Hertzog, has applied for the following work:

- Porch alterations

Comments from the community: None

Nathan Hertzog addressed the Commission. Mr. Hertzog said the original deck was there with a lot of the lumber. The original railings were rotten and so he changed that as well as the balusters. He said he did not ask for permission in advance and apologized for that. He said he planned to stain it a darker color to match the house colors.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Dana Moody made a motion to approve Case HZ-23-28: 5108 Beulah Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

1. Return to vertical balusters,
2. Stain or paint to match or blend with colors of the house.

Case #HZ-23-36 – 5419 St. Elmo Avenue – Alterations from COA

Project Description:

The applicant, Jennifer Zellner, has applied for the following work:

- Alterations from COA

Comments from the community: None

Jennifer Zellner addressed the Commission. Ms. Zellner said she did get the back railing to match the front porch. The front porch railing was too short and too wide and rusting for Code. The facade lights on the corners are for safety purposes. The parking

pad in the back is barely over 1,000 square feet and they had to get a land disturbance permit.

Owen MacClellan, Contractor for the project addressed the Commission. Mr. MacClellan said they have removed significant portions of the gravel and installed steps from the parking area to the house. The material is Mosaic cobblestone.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Piper Stromatt made a motion to approve Case HZ-23-36: 5419 St. Elmo Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Nathan Bird seconded the motion. John Brennan and Dana Moody voted no. The motion carried to approve.

There were conditions noted for the approval:

1. Dark sky wall mounted lights to be removed,
2. Railing to remain as is.

Case #HZ-23-38 – 4703 Florida Avenue – Storage Shed

Project Description:

The applicant, Paul and Liz Winters has applied for the following work:

- **Storage Shed**

Paul Winters addressed the Commission. Mr. Winters said the workshop is under the house and it would be nice not to have to step over the lawnmower to get to the tools. There used to be a garage under the house. He said since they are getting a prefab shed there would be options on the design although it could take up to 2 months if he needs to change the design.

Comments from the community: None

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Cliff McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-23-38: 4703 Florida Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion carried to approve.

OTHER BUSINESS:

None

NEXT MEETING DATE: May 18, 2023 (Application deadline: April 21, 2023 at 4 P.M.)

Skip Pond made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Dana Moody seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion passed and the meeting was adjourned.

The meeting was adjourned.



Skip Pond, Chair

5/18/2023

Date



Dottie Cannon, Secretary

5/18/23

Date