

Meeting Minutes

February 15, 2024

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on February 15th, 2024, at 9:30 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Skip Pond called the meeting to order, Andrew Pinion called the roll and Nia York swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Skip Pond, Clif McCormick, John Brennan, Matt McDonald, Piper Stromatt Todd Morgan

Members Absent: Dana Moody, Nathan Bird, Todd Morgan

Staff Members Present: Historic Planner Cassie Cline, Administrative Support Assistant II Andrew Pinion, Attorney Andrew Trundle

Applicants Present: Amber Clark, Carlton Butts, Nelson McDaniel, David Kaufmann, Keith Riley

Old Business:

HZ-23-129: 5203 Beulah Ave: New Construction

The Applicant Amber Clark has the following:

- New Construction

Staff Comments:

Historic Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

- 6.22 New Construction Page 52
- 6.9 Driveways and Paving Page 41

Applicant Amber Clark 5203 Beulah Ave. - spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission.

Community Member Denise Shaw 1402 W 54th St spoke about concerns she has regarding the stormwater runoff.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. John Brennan made a motion to approve Case #HZ-23-129 – 5203 Beulah Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval is subject to the following conditions:

1. The driveway material may be gravel.

Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion carries to approve.

HZ-23-165: 4505 Alabama Ave: Pool House and Fence

The Applicant Keith Riley has the following:

- New Construction

Staff Comments:

Historic Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

- Page 56 New Construction: Secondary Buildings

Applicant Keith Riley 516 Tucker St. - spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission.

Community Member Denise Shaw 1402 W 54th St spoke about concerns she has regarding the stormwater runoff.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Piper Stromatt made a motion to approve Case #HZ-23-165 – 4505 Alabama Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval is subject to the following conditions:

1. Siding to match existing materials on home.
2. Shingle style optional; metal standing seam or architectural

Cliff McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion carries to approve.

New Business:**HZ-23-170: 4306 St Elmo Ave: Addition**

The Applicant David Kaufman has the following:

- Proposed addition to the south side of the structure. Three stories including basement, vinyl clad windows, 3” cement board siding.

Staff Comments:

Historic Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.1 Additions Page 33.
6.6 Decks, Page 38.
6.27 Roofs, Page 62.
6.41 Windows, Page 74

Applicant David Kaufman 4306 St. Elmo Ave. - spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission.

Community Member Denise Shaw 1402 W 54th St spoke in favor of the build.
Community Member Keith Riley 516 Tucker St spoke in favor of the build

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Cliff McCormick made a motion to approve Case #HZ-23-159 – 4306 St Elmo Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval is subject to the following conditions:

1. Not intended to set a precedent; existing structure is not historic but was built prior to historic review; site topography does not allow for rear expansion; previous historic home on site was similar to foot print being proposed.

2. **Match existing detailing where applicable.**
3. **Front Porch or deck design is deferred; balance of application is approved.**

John Brennan seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion carries to approve.

Case #HZ-23-187 – 5506 Beulah Ave. – Renovation

Commission member Cliff McCormick recusing himself on this case.

Project Description:

The Applicant Lance Spencer has the following:

- Renovation

Staff Comments:

Historic Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.1 Additions Page 33.
6.27 Roofs, Page 62

Applicant Carlton Butts 5506 Beulah Ave - spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission.

Comments from the community:

Community Member Denise Shaw 1402 W 54th St spoke in favor of the project.

Community Member Cliff McCormick 318 Keith St spoke to the commission regarding his recusal.

Matt McDonald made a motion to table case HZ-23-187 until the end of the meeting. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion to table HZ-23-187 is approved.

Commission member Cliff McCormick rejoins the board at 10:34 AM.

Case #HZ-23-190 – 511 Central Ave. – Fence

Project Description:

- Fence

Staff Comments:

Historic Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

3.5 Fences, Walls, and Walks

Applicant Nelson McDaniel 511 Central Ave, Apt. A - spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission.

Comments from the community:

Community Member (and spouse of Applicant) Crystal McDaniel 511 Central Ave, Apt. A., Spoke about her medical condition and spoke in favor of the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Matt McDonald made a motion to defer Case #HZ-23-190 – 511 Central Ave, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines.

1. Deferral is based on a need for additional legal input.

John Brennan seconded the motion to defer. Two members voted against the motion. Three members voted to defer. The motion carries to defer.

Matt McDonald made a motion to un-table case HZ-23-187. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion to un-table HZ-23-187 is approved.

Piper Stromatt made a motion to approve Case #HZ-23-187 – 5506 Beulah Ave, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, approval with no conditions.

John Brennan seconded the motion to approve. All in favor, the motion carries to approve.

Matt McDonald made a motion to adjourn. John Brennan seconded the motion to adjourn. All in favor. The meeting is adjourned at 11:10 a.m.

Skip Pond, Chairman

Date

Andrew Pinion, Secretary

Date

Meeting Minutes

February 20, 2024

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on February 20th, 2024, at 9:30 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Skip Pond called the meeting to order, Andrew Pinion called the roll and Nia York swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Skip Pond, Clif McCormick, John Brennan, Matt McDonald, Piper Stromatt, Todd Morgan, Nathan Bird

Members Absent: Dana Moody

Staff Members Present: Historic Planner Cassie Cline, Administrative Support Assistant II Andrew Pinion, Attorney Christopher Knight

Applicants Present: Ross Young, Ryan Johnson, Laine Mitchell, Nathan Hefner

Old Business: None

New Business:

HZ-24-1: 5305 Alabama Ave: New Outbuilding

The Applicant Ryan Johnson has the following:

- New Outbuilding

Staff Comments:

Historic Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

Page 56 New Construction: Secondary Buildings

Applicant Ryan Johnson 5305 Alabama Ave. - spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. John Brennan made a motion to approve Case #HZ-24-1 – 5305 Alabama Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval is subject to the following conditions:

1. **As submitted**

Todd Morgan seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion carries to approve.

Nathan Bird enters meeting at 9:44 a.m.

HZ-24-6: 1311 W 46th St: New Construction

The Applicant Ross Young has the following:

- New Construction

Staff Comments:

Historic Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.22 New Construction, Page 22
6.9 Driveways and Paving, Page 41

Applicant Ross Young 206 Manufacturers Rd. - spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Piper Stromatt made a motion to approve Case #HZ-24-6 – 4505 Alabama Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval is subject to the following conditions:

1. Parking pad to be moved to the left side of the parcel.
2. Columns on front porch to be 6x6.

John Brennan seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion carries to approve.

HZ-24-7: 4812 Alabama Ave: Exterior Rehabilitation

Nia York swears in Applicant at 9:55 a.m.

Laine Mitchell (representing Applicant Jamie Day) has the following:

- Exterior Rehabilitation

Staff Comments:

Historic Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.41 Windows, Page 74
6.8 Doors, Page 40
6.25 Porches, Porch Columns Railings, Page 59
6.13 Foundations, Page 45
6.15 Gutters, Page 47

Laine Mitchell 4812 Alabama Ave. - spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Cliff McCormick made a motion to approve Case #HZ-23-159 – 4306 St Elmo Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval is subject to the following conditions:

1. Gutters to be half round with no fascia.
2. Brick and mortar exterior repair in kind is approved.
3. Existing historic window where door is being added to be retained on site.
4. Deck is approved, size as shown, material to be approved.
5. HVAC condenser relocation approved.
6. Interior plaster is not part of the guidelines; thus the commission makes no comment.
7. No siding replacement has been requested or approved; siding may be repaired in like kind.
8. Window replacement not approved due to lack of information.

Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion carries to approve.

Case #HZ-24-9 – 4360 Seneca Ave. – New Construction

Commission member Cliff McCormick recusing himself on this case.

Project Description:

The Applicant Nathan Hefner has the following:

- New Construction

Staff Comments:

Historic Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered:

6.22 New Construction, Page 22
6.9 Driveways and Paving, Page 41

Applicant Nathan Hefner 4614 St. Elmo Ave. - spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Todd Morgan made a motion to approve Case #HZ-24-9 – 4360 Seneca Ave, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, approval is subject to the following conditions:

1. Windows as per submitted and are not intended to set a precedent.

Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor. The motion carries to approve.

John Brennan made a motion to adjourn. Matt McDonald seconded the motion to adjourn. All in favor. The meeting is adjourned at 10:27 a.m.

Skip Pond, Chairman

Date

Andrew Pinion, Secretary

Date