

**Post-Audit Review 16-03:
Fire Equipment Maintenance**

January 2018

City Auditor

Stan Sewell, CPA, CGFM, CFE

Internal Auditor

Barry Teague, CPA, CFE, CGMA





OFFICE OF INTERNAL AUDIT

Stan Sewell, City Auditor

January 4, 2018

Subject: Post-Audit Review of Fire Equipment Maintenance (Report #16-03)

Dear Mayor Berke and City Council Members:

Attached is a summary report on the status of audit recommendations in our 2017 Fire Equipment Maintenance report. The purpose of this report is to confirm whether, and to what degree, management has implemented the recommendations made in the original audit.

The original audit concluded:

1. Steps are needed to ensure each apparatus receives periodic maintenance at the appropriate time interval for its status, per policy;
2. A comprehensive, NFPA compliant, Fire maintenance Policy and Procedure Manual is needed.

The audit had 11 recommendations to improve efficiency and effectiveness of the fire equipment maintenance process and associated record keeping. At the time of this Post-Audit Review, one recommendation was partially implemented, and ten were implemented. The recommendation partially implemented is herein reported to the Audit Committee for follow-up, as appropriate.

This Post-Audit Review consisted principally of inquiries of City personnel and examinations of various supporting documentation. It was substantially less in scope than an audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. The evidence obtained provided a reasonable basis for our conclusions; however, had an audit been performed, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you and our conclusions may have been modified.

Sincerely,

Stan Sewell, CPA, CGFM, CFE
City Auditor

Attachment

cc: Audit Committee Members
 Stacy Richardson, Chief of Staff
 Maura Sullivan, Chief Operating Officer
 Daisy Madison, Chief Financial Officer
 Justin Holland, Administrator, Public Works
 Phil Hyman, Fire Chief
 Gary Franks, Fleet Director
 Jim Arnette, TN Local Government Audit

RECOMMENDATION PARTIALLY IMPLEMENTED (1)

Recommendation	Actions Taken
1 We recommended CFD and Fleet management investigate placing firefighting apparatuses into a leasing program with pre-determined replacement dates.	The Chattanooga Fire Department inquired about the City vehicle leasing program and found there was insufficient funds available to purchase fire apparatuses. The leasing program has new leadership and CFD plans to check into the program in the future.

RECOMMENDATIONS PARTIALLY IMPLEMENTED (10)

Recommendation	Actions Taken
2 We recommended the process and training be updated to ensure an oil sample kit is pulled and mailed as part of each periodic maintenance and a procedure developed to ensure they are delivered to the vendor.	The importance of taking oil samples has been stressed to all mechanics. The SOP has been updated to show an oil sample must be taken at each service and the results recorded and placed in the vehicle file. A file has been placed on a share drive tracking when each sample is sent to the vendor, who sent it, when it is returned and the results of the test.
3 We recommended a written policy be put in place assigning a position the responsibility for recording the date oil samples are forwarded to the vendor and the date results are received back, with an appropriate timeframe for results to be received, and follow-up procedures developed for oil sample results not received by that date.	A written policy has been established assigning responsibility to parts room personnel to record testing and forwarding to the vendor. If a sample is not addressed in fourteen days, follow-up on the whereabouts of the results is begun.
4 We recommended steps be taken to ensure each fire apparatus receive a periodic maintenance at the appropriate time interval for its status, per policy.	Fleet has developed a NFPA (National Fire Prevention Association) compliant schedule to perform all scheduled preventive maintenance on fire apparatuses. The service may be performed either in-house, or by an outside vendor, if necessary, due to time constraints.

Recommendation	Actions Taken
5 We recommended a written policy be developed and placed in the policies and procedures manual requiring each apparatus receive periodic maintenance at its scheduled timeframe.	A policy has been written and placed in the Policy & Procedure manual that requires each apparatus be serviced as scheduled.
6 We recommended Fleet management develop a procedure to ensure all employees have access to required training.	Employees now have access to some training via LMS. Also, some funds are available for mechanics to use for vehicle training.
7 We recommended Fleet personnel note on the work order any work performed to test outsourced work.	Any work performed on an apparatus outsourced for repairs is now noted on the work order, as well as posted into the electronic work order system history.
8 We recommended management develop written procedures stating steps to be taken when an apparatus is sent to an outside vendor, as well as steps to check out the apparatus when it is returned.	A policy has been put in place detailing steps to be followed when an apparatus is sent out for service, as well as steps to be taken upon its return and prior to being returned to service.
9 We recommended Fleet management develop a comprehensive, NFPA compliant, Fire maintenance Policy and Procedure Manual. We recommended the development and issuance of a comprehensive policy and procedure manual for the Fleet Division in multiple previous audits.	A NFPA compliant policy and procedure manual has been written for fire maintenance. An SOP will be written for each function in the Fleet Division, to comply with Public Works policy, in the near future.
10 We recommended Fleet management develop a method of records inventory to track when/where records are moved to storage, as well as their location in the storage room. We also recommended controlled access and a check out system be put in place. This was previously recommended in Audit 09-12.	An area in the locked upstairs parts room is being used to store vehicle files and work orders. This area is scheduled to be fenced in soon. Access is limited to parts room personnel. Parts employees maintain a detailed check-out/check-in listing. This change has been enacted for the entire Fleet Division.

Recommendation**Actions Taken**

11 We recommended Fleet employees receive training on City Records Retention policy.

The City Records Retention policy has been distributed to all employees, and copies posted in conspicuous places.

City of Chattanooga Fraud, Waste, and Abuse Hotline

Internal Audit's Fraud, Waste, and Abuse Hotline gives employees and citizens an avenue to report misconduct, waste or misuse of resources in any City facility or department.

Internal Audit contracts with a hotline vendor, The Network, to provide and maintain the reporting system. The third party system allows for anonymous reports. All reports are taken seriously and responded to in a timely manner. Reports to the hotline serve the public interest and assist the Office of Internal Audit in meeting high standards of public accountability.

To make a report, call 1-877-338-4452 or visit our website:

www.chattanooga.gov/internal-audit